

Preserving the Past and Enlightening the Present / Carsten-Michael Walbiner. — Extrait de : Parole de l'Orient : revue semestrielle des études syriaques et arabes chrétiennes : recherches orientales : revue d'études et de recherches sur les églises de langue syriaque. — vol. 34 (2009), pp. 433-441.

Titre de couverture : Actes du colloque melkite : Jounieh, janvier 2008

I. Littérature chrétienne — Histoire et critique. II. église melkite — Histoire. III. Macarius al-Zaim, Patriarche d'Antioche, 1600-.... — Biographies.

PER L1183 / FT259685P

PRESERVING THE PAST AND ENLIGHTENING THE PRESENT.
MACARIUS B. AL-ZA'ĪM
AND MEDIEVAL MELKITE LITERATURE*

BY

Carsten-Michael WALBINER

This contribution aims at answering the question how the Melkite heritage of the Middle Ages was perceived by someone of a later generation, namely a man who flourished in the 17th century and has to be regarded as the most productive author of the Melkites in early modern times. The man in question is Macarius b. al-Za'īm, who was Greek Orthodox Patriarch of Antioch from 1647 until 1672. Born in Aleppo around the year 1600, the son of an Orthodox priest, he received the modest education of his time and learned the craft of a weaver¹. But he was fortunate enough to belong to the entourage of the enlightened Metropolitan Meletius Karma of Aleppo who started a literary and cultural renaissance among his community in Aleppo in which Macarius took part². While his teacher Karma was mainly concerned with a revision of the liturgical books and a new translation of the Arabic Bible³, Macarius developed very broad interests with an emphasis on everything connected with the history and tradition of his community⁴. Most of

*) I'm most grateful to Dr Hilary Kilpatrick of Lausanne for her valuable advise in certain questions of language and content.

1) On the life of Macarius see Carsten-Michael WALBINER, *Die Mitteilungen des griechisch-orthodoxen Patriarchen Makarius Ibn az-Za'īm von Antiochia (1647-1672) über Georgien nach dem arabischen Autograph von St. Petersburg*, Ph.D. thesis, Leipzig, 1995, pp. 8-28; Nawufitus IDLIBI, *Asāqifat al-Rūm al-Malikiyīn bi-Ḥalab fī l-'aṣr al-ḥadīth*, Aleppo, 1983, pp. 57-71, 81-97.

2) Cf. IDLIBI, *Asāqifat al-Rūm*, pp. 36-37, 67-70.

3) On this aspect of Karma's activities see Joseph NASRALLAH, *Histoire du mouvement littéraire dans l'Église melchite du V^e au XX^e siècle* (henceforth *HLMEM*), vol. IV/1, Louvain, 1979, pp. 78-85; Carsten-Michael WALBINER, "«Und um Jesu willen, schickt sie nicht ungebunden!» Die Bemühungen des Meletius Karma (1572-1635) um den Druck arabischer Bücher in Rom", in Rifaat EBIED, Herman TEULE (eds.), *Studies on the Christian Arabic Heritage in Honour of Father Prof. Dr. Samir Khalil Samir S.I. at the Occasion of his Sixty-Fifth Birthday*, Leuven-Paris-Dudley, 2004, pp. 163-175.

4) On Macarius as a historian see Joseph NASRALLAH, "L'œuvre historique du pa-

such knowledge had to be collected from disparate sources. Part of it had been forgotten over the course of time and was thus to be re-discovered, other things were totally unknown and made their way into the canon of knowledge of the Greek Orthodox in the Arab lands for the first time thanks to the efforts of Macarius. In his introduction to this symposium, Father Khalil Samir spoke of a “rupture de tradition” – a break in tradition – and Macarius’ work bears witness to that fact. He was a ceaseless seeker after knowledge with a clear confessional bent⁵. But let us listen to Macarius himself to learn how he describes his motives and activities in the field of acquiring knowledge. These activities mainly started after Macarius had been made bishop of his home town Aleppo in 1635.

وبعد نياح المرحوم معلمي كرمه لما طفت انا الفقير ماكارياوس كل ابرشيتنا وفحصت
وفتشت على ساير ما فيه من الكتب المقدسة لكثرة محبتي لذلك⁶.

“After the death of my late teacher [Meletius] Karma, I, the humble Macarius, visited our whole diocese and looked and searched for all the holy books to be found there because of my great love of that”.

What these efforts looked like, Macarius reports in the following words:

واني ارسلت وقتيذ [يعني بعد سياحته مطراناً على حلب] الى دمشق وبلادها والي ساير
رؤسا الكهنة الذين في بلادنا وروسا الديرورة والي كهنة القرى وقصدتهم بان يفتشوا
على اخبار القديسين الموجودين عندهم وفي بلادهم ويرسلوا يعلموني منهم. ففعلوا
كذلك وارسلوا لي صورة ساير ما عندهم من اخبار القديسين وغيرهم. [...] ووجدت
ايضاً في محروسة صيدنايا كتاباً قديماً جداً. [...] ووجدت ايضاً في قرية قطينه التي في
بلاد حمص كتاب قديم جداً وكانت كتابته من حين كانت مدينة انطاكيه بيد

triarche d’Antioche Macaire III Za’im”, in *BEO* 25 (1972), pp. 191-202; *HLMEM*, vol. IV/1, pp. 90-99; Carsten-Michael WALBINER, “Makarius Ibn az-Za’im als Historiker: Anliegen - Arbeitsweise - Ergebnisse”, in Holger PREISSLER and Heidi STEIN (eds.), *Annäherung an das Fremde. XXVI. Deutscher Orientalistentag vom 25. bis 29.9.1995 in Leipzig* (= *ZDMG-Supplement*, 11), Stuttgart, 1998, pp. 155-163; IDEM, “Macarius Ibn al-Za’im and the beginnings of an Orthodox church historiography in Bilād al-Shām”, forthcoming in the proceedings of the conference *Musāhamat al-mu’arriḥīn al-urṭūduks fī l-ta’rīḥ* (University of Balamand, 12-14 March 2007), al-Balamand, Lebanon, 2008.

5) On Macarius’ confessional approach in writing history see WALBINER, “Macarius Ibn al-Za’im and the beginnings of an Orthodox church historiography”.

6) *Ms. Beirut, Bibliothèque Oriental, 1343*, fol. 28a. – All quotations follow without alteration the writing of the originals.

النصارى. [...] فساختاه مع غيره من اخبار المذكورين اعلاه. واستنسختهم كلهم ووقفهم على قلاية المطرانية [بحلب]⁷.

“At that time [i.e. after he had been consecrated Metropolitan of Aleppo] I sent word to Damascus and its region and to all the bishops which are in our land as well as to the abbots of the monasteries and the village priests, requesting them to search for the accounts of the saints existing in their regions and to send [word] to inform me. And they did so, sending a copy of all the stories of the saints and others which were available [to them]. [...] And I found a very old book [...] in well-guarded Şaydnāyā. Furthermore I found in the village of Qaḏīna, which is near Homs, a very old book which was written when Antioch was in the hands of the Christians. [...] We copied it together with the accounts of the above-mentioned people. We ordered them all to be copied and donated them to the Bishop's residence [in Aleppo]”.

And Macarius did not stop these activities after his election as patriarch:

ولما صرت بطريركاً بدمشق ففتشت وبحثت في كتب قلاية البطريركية لانظر هل يوجد فيها اسامي واخبار بطاركة انطاكية. [...] وكذلك لما طفت في اول بطركيتي على ساير ابرشيتنا فلم اترك دير ولا كنيسة ولا قرية حتى فتشت كتبها⁸.

“After I had become Patriarch in Damascus, I examined and explored the books of the patriarchal residence in order to learn whether they contained the names of patriarchs of Antioch and reports about them. [...] And when, at the beginning of my patriarchate, I visited our whole diocese I did not leave a monastery, church or village before I had examined its books”.

So Macarius made use of his authority as a church leader to search for books and documents in the villages and towns of Syria. But of special significance were undoubtedly the extensive journeys which took him to the Romanian principalities, the Ukraine, Russia and Georgia⁹. According to his

7) Cf. Lawundiyūs KILZI, “ ‘Ināyat al-baṭriyark Makāriyūs al-rābi’ Za’īm bi-ḡam’ aḥbār al-qiddīsīn”, in *al-Masarra* 25 (1939), pp. 617-623, 686-691, here: 620-621.

8) *Ms. St. Petersburg, Institute for Oriental Studies, B 1227*, p. 189.

9) On these journeys see Hilary KILPATRICK, “Journeying towards modernity. The ‘safrat al-baṭrak Makāriyūs’ of Būlus al-Ḥalabī”, in *Die Welt des Islams* 37/2 (1997), pp. 156-177; Juliette RASSI, “Rihlat Makāriyūs b. al-Za’īm ilā Rūsiyā ka-maḥaṭṭa muhimma fī tārfī al-‘alāqāt bayna Rūsiyā wa-urṭūduks al-šarq”, in University of Balamand (ed.), *Rūsiyā wa-urṭūduks al-šarq*, Balamand, Lebanon, 1998, pp. 63-97; WALBINER, *Die Mitteilungen*; IDEM, “Vom ‘Elend der Fremde’ - Die Reise des Patriarchen Makarius nach Georgien (1664/65)”, in *Georgica* 15 (1992), pp. 61-66; IDEM, “The second journey of Macarius ibn az-Za’īm to Rus-

own words, during these travels he wrote 15 “books”¹⁰ which represent the bulk of his literary production¹¹. They are mostly translations from Greek, mainly of more or less contemporary authors, but there are also four highly interesting collections (*mağmū’*) in which he entered whatever he found interesting to himself and useful for his readers. Thus, beside very short remarks of a few lines these include elaborated treatises – for example on the history of the patriarchs of Antioch or the saints of its region. It is in these collections that we find traces of earlier Melkite authors whose works Macarius undoubtedly counted amongst the “holy books” he was searching for and which in his times were often no longer known to people.

But this diving into the past was not an end in itself for Macarius. Beside the satisfaction of his own curiosity, he understood his work as an encouragement to his flock to learn about the history and tradition of their Church¹².

Although Macarius was more a collector and a translator than an original author, he has nevertheless also left a few treatises – mainly the introductions to his translations and collections – which reveal a deeper reflection on the subjects which concerned him. The introduction to the “Book of the Bee” (*Kitāb al-Nahla*) occupies an outstanding position here. In it Macarius traces the history of Christianity in the regions of the patriarchate of Antioch from the coming of Christ until his own days. He places special emphasis on the influence Islam exercised on the development of the Church in general and the Orthodox community in particular. Macarius’ view is most interesting as it is totally different from that upheld by both the Greek Orthodox and the Melkite Churches nowadays. In the words of greeting Bishop Michel Abraş read on behalf of Patriarch Gregory III, we heard that the Melkite Church of Antioch was described as “the Church of the Arabs, even of Islam”, and one can find similar statements by the leaders of the Orthodox Church of Anti-

sia (1666-1668)”, in University of Balamand (ed.), *Rūsiyā wa-urūduks al-şarq*, Balamand, Lebanon, 1998, pp. 99-114.

10) Cf. *Ms. Gotha, Research Library, ar. 1580*, foll. 180b-182a; WALBINER, *Die Mitteilungen*, pp. 30-31; Victor ROSEN, *Notices sommaires des manuscrits arabes du Musée Asiatique*, St. Petersburg, 1881, pp. 133-135.

11) For the works of Macarius see *HLMEM*, vol. IV/1, pp. 89-126; WALBINER, *Die Mitteilungen*, pp. 29-38.

12) On the motives for Macarius’ literary activities see WALBINER, *Die Mitteilungen*, pp. 30-31; IDEM, “Makarius Ibn az-Za’īm als Historiker”, p. 158; IDEM, “Macarius Ibn al-Za’īm and the beginnings of an Orthodox church historiography” (‘motives and aims’).

och too. For Macarius, by contrast, Muslim rule meant foremost oppression and violence, which finally led to enforced Arabisation and thus to a massive break in tradition. For him the Melkite tradition was clearly linked with the Greek language as this was the language of the Church Fathers, of the literary heritage which forms the backbone of Orthodox identity. As a result of the Muslim conquest and rule the people lost their ability to read and speak in Greek and were thus cut off from their tradition¹³. And for Macarius this situation is the starting point of Melkite literature, as he says:

فلما نظر الله صبرهم ورحمهم وارسل لهم رجل فاضل يدعى الشماس عبد الله ابن فضل الانطاكي. وكان عالماً جداً باللغة العربية واليونانية والسريانية. فاخرج للمسيحيين ساير الكتب العتيقة والجديدة المقدسة مع ساير تفاسيرها للغة العربية وامرهم بقراءتها في ساير السبوت والاحاد والاعياد السيدية. واخبار القديسين. وافنى كل عمره في هذه الاعمال الصالحة. وابقى لنا القوانين باليوناني والسرياني لانهما الاصل ولكي لا نترك هذه اللغات المقدسة التي نطقوا بها ابائنا القديسين. ثم بعد هذا الفاضل ظهر لنا الاب الفاضل بولص اسقف صيدا وفعل كذلك بحسب مقدرته. وظهر ايضاً لوقا الاقريطشي المتعرب وفعل كذلك. وظهر نيكن المغبوط رئيس دير سمعان العجايبى الانطاكي وصنف كتاب الحاوي الذي هو لكل جرح مداوي وكتابين اخر دونه وفعل حسب مقدرته. وظهر جراسيموس البار رئيس دير مار سمعان وصنف لنا الكتاب الشافي في المعنى الكافي. ثم ظهر القديس اثناسيوس بطرك اورشليم وصنف العظة لمنفعة المومنين وبدأت الامانة وتفسير الكتب الالهية تنمو وتزداد جيل بعد جيل. هولاء المذكورين فسروا لنا الامور الضرورية اللازمة لنا وابقوا غيرها لكثرتها وصنفوا هم مقالات عظيمة نافعة. وهكذا كنت انا الفقير اذا نظرت كتاب رومي غريب يشتمل على منافع روحانية ليس موجودة في لساننا كنت اجتهد على حسب المقدرة واخرج منه ما هو معدوم عندنا¹⁴.

13) See Carsten WALBINER, "A rare revelation: an Arab Christian of the 17th century reflects on the influence Islam exercised over the course of time on the development of his community", paper presented at the international conference "Discrimination and Tolerance in the Middle East", Lebanese American University Beirut, 2-4 May 2007, forthcoming in the proceedings of the conference. By the way, it is obvious that Macarius' view contradicts the historical facts. There is no proof for the enforced Arabisation Macarius bases his concept of Melkite intellectual decline upon.

14) Introduction to *Kitāb al-Naḥla*, published by Ḥabīb AL-ZAYYĀT, in *Ḥazā'in al-kutub*

“When God saw their patience he had mercy on them and sent them an excellent man, the deacon **‘Abdallāh Ibn Faḍl al-Anṭākī**¹⁵. He was very learned in Arabic, Greek and Syriac, and he translated all the books of the Old and New Testaments together with their commentaries into Arabic for the Christians, ordering them to read them on all Saturdays, Sundays and feasts of the Lord. And [he also translated] the lives of the Saints. He devoted all his life to these pious deeds. He left us the canons (*al-Qawānīn*) in Greek and Syriac because these were the original languages, and so that we do not give up these holy languages in which our holy Fathers spoke. Then, after this excellent man, we saw the excellent father **Paul, Bishop of Sidon**¹⁶. And he did likewise, according to his abilities. And there was also **Luke the Cretan «the Arabicised»**¹⁷, who did the same thing. Then came the blessed **Nikon**¹⁸, abbot of the monastery of Symeon the Wonder-Worker from Antioch, who composed the book [called] «The comprehensive collection» (*al-Ḥāwī*) which is a treatment for every wound. And [he composed] two other books according to his ability. Subsequently there was the pious **Gerasimus**¹⁹, abbot of the monastery of Saint Symeon, who wrote for us «The book of healing concerning the adequate meaning» (*al-Šāfi fī l-ma‘nā al-kāfi*)²⁰. Then came Saint **Athanasius, Patriarch of Jerusalem**²¹, writer of «The sermon for the benefit of the believers» (*al-‘iẓa li-manfa‘at al-mu[']minīn*). And faith and [knowledge of] the commentaries of the Holy Scriptures began to grow and increase generation after generation. Those [men] we have mentioned explained for us the essential things which are needful for us. But they left other things [unexplained or untranslated] because there were so many of them. They wrote great and useful treatises. And I did likewise. When I saw a strange Greek book which was spiritually beneficial but not available in our language I used to strive as best I could and translate what we lacked”.

fī Dimašq wa-ḍawāhīhā, Cairo, 1902, pp. 144-151, here 150; see also Y. AL-ḤADDĀD, “Qišṣat al-masīhiyya fī l-bilād al-‘arabiyya min «Kitāb al-Naḥla» li-l-baṭriyark Makāriyūs al-Ḥalabī”, in *al-Masarra* 60 (1974), pp. 514-521, here 519-520.

15) *HMLEM*, vol. 3/1, Louvain, 1983, pp. 191-229.

16) *HMLEM*, vol. 3/1, pp. 257-269.

17) This author could not be identified.

18) *HMLEM*, vol. 3/1, pp. 110-122. For some bio-bibliographical information on Nikon gathered by Macarius see *Ms. Homs, Greek Orthodox Metropolitanate*, 28, foll. 35a-35b.

19) *HMLEM*, vol. 3/2, Louvain, 1981, pp. 115-118.

20) According to Joseph NASRALLAH (*HMLEM*, vol. 3/2, p. 115) and Georg GRAF (*GCAL*, vol. 2, Vatican City, 1947, p. 82), the title is *Kitāb al-kāfi fī l-ma‘nā al-šāfi*, i.e. The book of sufficiency concerning the healing meaning.

21) *HMLEM*, vol. 3/2, pp. 52-55.

But there was another category of Melkite authors Macarius esteemed highly, the historians. In a short tract on Greek and Melkite historians he says:

وهولاي المدكورين اعلاه فان كتبهم كلها موجوده عند جماعة الروم اخوتنا ومشهوداً لهم بالصدق ومعروفين عند جماعة الافرنج ايضاً. وبعدهم ظهورا كثيرين وكتبوا تواريخ الكنيسة ولهم في ذلك كتباً كثيرة. واما نحن ففي بلادنا فمن كثرة البلايا والمصائب التي دهمتهم اهلوا كتابة تواريخ الكنيسة. واشتهر فيهم عندنا المغبوط سعيد ابن بطريق وتاريخه الجميل. وبعده تاريخ سعد ابن يحيى الانطاكي وهو عجباً جداً. وايضاً كتاب تاريخ اغايوس ابن قسطنطين المنبجي، ثم تاريخ المغبوط نيكن ريس دير سمعان العجايبى. وغيرهم من اهل بلادنا لهم تواريخ مختصره.²²

“And the books of those [authors] mentioned above [he had spoken of the Greek historians Eusebius of Caesarea, Socrates, Theodoret of Cyr, Evagrius, and Sozomenos] can be found among the Greek community, our brothers, and are regarded by them as trustworthy. They are also known among the community of the Franks. After them there came many others who wrote the histories of the Church; they have left many books on that [subject]. As for us, the writing of Church history was neglected in our lands because of the many afflictions and tragedies which befell people. We think that the blessed **Sa’id b. Biṭrīq**²³ and his beautiful history have become famous among them, and then the history of **Sa’d [sic] b. Yahyā al-Anṭākī**²⁴ which is very wonderful, furthermore the history of **Agapios b. Qusṭanṭīn al-Manbiḡī**²⁵, and the history of blessed **Nikon**²⁶, abbot of the monastery of Saint Symeon the Wonder-Worker. Other people of our country have written short histories”.

How much Macarius esteemed and even venerated these earlier authors

22) *Ms. Homs, Greek Orthodox Metropolitanate*, 28, fol. 22b.

23) Also called Eutychius, cf. *HMLEM*, vol. 2/2, Louvain, 1988, pp. 23-34.

24) *HMLEM*, vol. 3/1, pp. 167-172.

25) *HMLEM*, vol. 3/2, pp. 50-52.

26) Nikon is not known to have written an explicitly historical treatise, but his works contain a lot of historical information which Macarius has exploited for his own writings, namely for his treatises on Georgian church history (cf. Carsten-Michael WALBINER, Mariam NANOBASHVILI, “Nicon’s treatise on the conversion of the Georgians in Christian Arabic literature and its possible Georgian source”, in *Le Muséon* 121/3-4 (2008), 437-461, here 446-448, or his history of the patriarchs of Antioch (cf. *Ms. St. Petersburg, B 1227*, pp. 155, 178, 179). On Nikon and his works see above fn. 18.

can be learned from his Synaxarion in which he also bestowed the title of “Saint” on a number of mediaeval Melkite writers, historians and others:

وايضاً القديس ثاودورس بطرك انطاكيه الرجل الفاضل الالهي الذي صَنَّف كتاب
الفلصامون المشهور عند المعلمين. [...] وايضاً القديس بولص اسقف صيدا
المشهور فضله وعلمه وكتبه الممثليه حكمه ومنافع، وتوفي بسلام. وايضاً
القديس ميخائيل اسقف الاثرب الذي صَنَّف الطب الروحاني وانتقل بسلام.
وايضاً جراسيموس ريس دير القديس سمعان العجايبى صاحب المجادلات
والمواعظ وغير ذلك مع الكتاب الشافي المشهور فضله. [...] وايضاً القديس
نيكونوس ريس دير سمعان العجايبى أيضاً الذي صنف الحاوي الكبير وغيره
المرثيه كتبه فضائل ومنافع. وبعد شيخوخة حميده انتقل الي الرب. وايضاً
القديس الاحل الشيخ الفاضل الشماس عبد الله ابن الفضل الانطاكي الذي انار
البلاد العربيه بتفاسيره الالهيه وتعاليمه المحييه المشهور فضله؛ تنيح بسلام وخلف
للكنائس مصنفات كثيره.²⁷

“And Saint **Theodore**²⁸, Patriarch of Antioch, the godly and excellent man who wrote the «**Balsamon**» (*al-falṣāmūn*)²⁹, famous amongst the learned, [is also counted among the saints...]. So is Saint **Paul, Bishop of Sidon**³⁰, who is famous for his excellence and knowledge and his books full of wisdom and benefits. He died in peace. And so is Saint **Michael, Bishop of al-Athrib**³¹, author of «The spiritual medicine» (*al-tibb al-rūḥānī*), who passed away in peace. And also **Gerasimus**³², abbot of the Monastery of Saint Symeon the Wonder-Worker, author of «The Disputations» (*al-muḡādalāt*) and «The Sermons» (*al-mawāʿiẓ*) and other [works] like the book «The Healer» (*al-ṣāfi*) whose excellence is well-known. [...] There is also Saint **Nikonus**³³ [sic], Abbot of the Monastery of Saint Symeon the Wonder-Worker, author of «The Great Compendium» (*al-Ḥāwī al-kabīr*) and other books full of virtues and benefit.

27) Ms. London, British Museum, ar. chr. 28 [Add. 9965], foll. 45b-46a.

28) *HMLEM*, vol. 3/1, pp. 93-96. For a short biographic remark by Macarius on Balsamon see *Ms. Homs, Greek Orthodox Metropolitanate*, 28, fol. 31b.

29) In fact, Balsamon is part of the author's name and not the title of the book.

30) See above fn. 16.

31) This author – regarded by Macarius as a Melkite – was in fact a Copt, but his work was very popular amongst Melkite readers (see GRAF, *Geschichte*, vol. 2, pp. 414-427, especially pp. 420-426).

32) See above fn. 19.

33) See above fn. 26.

Having reached a praiseworthy old age he passed away to the Lord. There is also the noble saint and excellent master Deacon 'Abdallāh Ibn al-Faḍl al-Anṭākī³⁴, famous for his virtue, who enlightened the Arab lands with his godly commentaries [on the Holy Scriptures] and his life-giving teachings. He died in peace and left the churches many writings”.

Thus far the words of Macarius, which may be followed by a short conclusion.

Through his ceaseless collecting and studying of manuscripts, Macarius was able to gain a quite good overview of the Melkite literature of the Middle Ages. But it is obvious that some great names are missing which means that although he did his best he was not able totally to undo the “rupture de tradition” which divided the Middle Ages from his own times.

By encouraging the copying and reading of these works Macarius tried to keep the earlier tradition alive amongst his co-religionists. Furthermore it should be noted that he used several of the authors mentioned above as sources for his own writings, mainly historians like Agapios al-Manbiḡī³⁵, Sa'īd b. al-Biṭrīq³⁶ and Yaḥyā al-Anṭākī³⁷ but also Nikon of the Black Mountain³⁸.

With his indefatigable activities Macarius still offers an example to all who strive to preserve the Melkite heritage of which he himself became an important part.

Deutscher Akademischer Austauschdienst /
German Academic Exchange Service
Referat 443 (Golfstaaten) /
Section 443 (Gulf States)
Kennedyallee 50, D-53175 Bonn, GERMANY
E-mail: walbiner@daad.de
<http://www.daad.de>

Carsten-Michael WALBINER

34) See above fn. 15.

35) Juliette RASSI-RIHANI, “Sources arabes du «Livre de l’Abeille» (Kitāb al-Naḥlah) de Makāriyūs Ibn al-Za'im”, in *ParOr* 21 (1996), pp. 215-244, here: 233-234, 235-236.

36) Cf. for example *Ms. St. Petersburg, B 1227*, pp. 82, 123, 189; *Ms. Homs, Greek Orthodox Metropolitanate*, 28, foll. 106b-107a; RASSI-RIHANI, “Sources arabes”, p. 234.

37) Cf. for example *Ms. St. Petersburg, B 1227*, pp. 84, 123, 176, 189; *Ms. Šarbā, collection Dayr aš-Šīr, 600*, pp. 670-682, 708-719 (cf. Miḥā'il ABRAŠ, “Maḥṭūṭat «Maḡmū' laṭīf» li-l-baṭriyark Makāriyūs al-ṭāliṭ Za'im [1647-1672]”, in *al-Mashriq* 68 [1994], pp. 446, 447).

38) See above fn. 26.