

Tables.

Texts in english and in arabic.

1. Apocalypse of Paul (arabic version) — Criticism, interpretation, etc..

PER L1183 / FT71903P
A FIRST EVALUATION OF THE
«ARABIC VERSION OF THE APOCALYSE OF PAUL»*

BY
Alessandro BAUSI

PREAMBLE  ........................................................................................................... 133
INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................ 133
  1. The Apocalyp of Paul ....................................................................................... 133
  2. The versions of the ApP ............................................................................... 134
A. RECENT RESEARCHES ON THE AP P: ROSENSTIEHL (1990) AND
  PIOVANELLI (1993) ......................................................................................... 134
  1. Rosenstiehl (1990): the narrative structure .................................................. 134
B. THE ARABIC VERSION (ARAPP) ................................................................. 136
  1. Previous studies on the ARAPP ................................................................. 136
  2. The manuscripts ....................................................................................... 137
  3. Dating of the manuscripts ........................................................................ 137
  4. Manuscripts not registered in GCAL ......................................................... 137
C. THE RECENSIONS OF THE ARAPP .............................................................. 137
  1. Ar.1 ......................................................................................................... 138
  2. Ar.2 ......................................................................................................... 138
  3. Ar.3 ......................................................................................................... 138
D. ANALYSIS OF AR.1 AND AR.2 ................................................................. 139
  1. Prologue ............................................................................................... 139
  2. §§ 1-2. The discovery of the ApP ............................................................. 142
  3. §§ 1-2 are completely missing .............................................................. 143

*) The bibliographical abbreviations follow the text of the article. The mss. of the
ARAPP are quoted according to the list, furnished with bibliographical references to the cata-
logs, which follows the bibliographical abbreviations. There is no reference to the cata-
logs in the text and in the footnotes to the text. All the transcribed texts reproduce inter-
punctuation and spellings of the mss.
4. §§ 3-6. The creation complains in front of God about men’s behaviour ................................................................. 143
5. §§ 7-10. The angels report to God about men ................................................. 144
6. §§ 11-18. Paul is taken to the firmament by an angel; there he looks at the judgement of one pious and two sinners .................. 144
7. Τορτοφούχος and Τημελούχος ................................................................. 145
8. §§ 19-21. Paul ascends to the third sky, then comes back to the firmament ........................................................................ 147
9. §§ 21-31. Paul visits the promised land and the city of the saints beyond the Ocean, to the East of the inhabited land, then comes back .................................................................................. 148
10. §§ 31-42. Paul visits the places of the punishments, beyond the Ocean, to the West of the inhabited land ........................................ 148
11. §§ 43-44. Paul obtains the Sunday rest for the sinners .................... 150
12. §§ 45-51. Paul visits «in spirit» the Paradise ........................................... 150
13. The Oil of Mercy ..................................................................................... 150

E. CONCLUSIONS: THE TENTATIVE VORLAGE OF THE TWO ARABIC VERSIONS .............................................................................. 152
1. Ar.1 .............................................................................................................. 152
2. Ar.2 .............................................................................................................. 153

F. DESIDERATA. OTHER TEXTS RELATED WITH THE APP. THE DERSĀNA MIKÄEL ................................................................. 153
1. The Vision of Pseudo-Athanasius ........................................................... 153
2. The Homily of Timotheus in the Ethiopic Dersāna Mikäel ........... 154
PREAMBLE

This paper intends to be a presentation of the work being carried on in view of the critical edition of the Arabic version of the Apocalypse of Paul (\(=\) ArApP). It deals with the main perspectives of the editorial work: the present results of the recensio (finding out of the mss., at the moment mainly through the examination of the catalogues); the evidence of a preliminary edition of two distinct recensions from two mss. (Bibliothèque Nationale, Par.ar.5072, and Bibliothèque Nationale, Par.ar.4874); and finally, the main desiderata.

The critical edition of the ArApP is part, on one side, of the comprehensive critical edition of all the extant versions of the Apocalypse of Paul, planned by the AELAC («Association pour l’étude de la littérature apocryphe chrétienne»); on the other side, it is part of the «mise à jour de GCAL I», directed by Dr. Samir Khalil Samir, S.J., as far as the Apocrypha of the Apostles are concerned.

INTRODUCTION

1. THE APOCALYPSE OF PAUL

The Apocalypse or Vision of Paul (\(=\) ApP)\(^1\) consists in the narrative of the ascension and voyage to the sky of the Apostle, who assists at the judgement of souls after death, visits the promised land and the places of the punishment, obtains the Sunday rest for the sinners through intercession of Michael the archangel, and finally visits the Paradise. The narrative is certainly inspired by the famous verses of Paul in 2 Corinthians 12.2-5. The ApP greatly contributed to creating a twofold afterlife space in Medieval imagery, with its peculiar geography\(^2\). The diffusion of the text is huge. We know versions in almost every language of the Eastern and Western Christianities\(^3\). Moreover, elements of the ApP were used in other texts describing

\(^{1}\) For a general introduction and standard references on the ApP see James (1924) 552-555, Duensing (1964), Erbetta (1969) 353-386. Full information on versions and textual tradition of the ApP is available in Cant 205-209 (n. 325) and Piovanello (1993) 26-37. Consequently, hereafter I will quote only the main sources.


as well the sort of the souls after death and the afterlife world.

2. THE VERSIONS OF THE AP\textit{P}

As one can easily realize while reading n. 325 entry in \textit{Clavis Apocryphorum Novi Testamenti} (= \textit{CANT}), the study of the AP\textit{P} has focused till now on the main versions derived from the universally acknowledged and almost totally lost Greek original (= \textit{Gr.1})\textsuperscript{4}. It is to remark that the wholly preserved Greek text which we own, is certainly a secondary one (= \textit{Gr.2})\textsuperscript{5}. Till now we have editions of the main Greek- (\textit{Gr.1}) dependent versions: Coptic (1 recension) (= \textit{Copt})\textsuperscript{6}, Syriac (2 recensions = \textit{Syr.1}, Nestorian\textsuperscript{7}, and \textit{Syr.2}, Jacobite, inedited),\textsuperscript{8} Latin (1 main recension, and 12 secondary recensions probably all depending on the first Latin one = \textit{Lat.1})\textsuperscript{9}, Slavonic (2 main recensions = \textit{Slav})\textsuperscript{10}; all the 4 Armenian recensions (= \textit{Arm.1}, \textit{Arm.2}, \textit{Arm.3}, \textit{Arm.4})\textsuperscript{11} seem to be derived from a Syriac one. The Arabic versions, as well as the Georgian one, are completely inedited and not yet examined.


1. ROSENSTIEHL (1990): THE NARRATIVE STRUCTURE

The narrative structure of the AP\textit{P} has been recently clearly identified by ROSENSTIEHL (1990). Traditionally, the arrangement of the texts is com-


\textsuperscript{4} Fragments are extant, but still inedited. See PIOVANELLI (1993) 26.

\textsuperscript{5} TSCHENORDORF (1866) xiv-xvii, 34-69.

\textsuperscript{6} BUDGE (1915) 534-574 (text), 1043-1084 (translation).

\textsuperscript{7} PERKINS (1866) and RICCIOTTI (1933). All the known Syriac mss. (\textit{Syr.1} and \textit{Syr.2}) are listed by DESREUMAUX (1993) 66, and Alain DESREUMAUX, \textit{Un manuscrit syriaque de Téhéran contenant des Apocryphes}, in Apocrypha 5 (1994) 137-164 (158-159).

\textsuperscript{8} See CASEY (1933) 3-4, who personally examined the Jacobite ms Harvard Semitic Museum 3985, now Houghton Library, Harvard University, Cambridge, Mass., Syr. 59 (Cod. 3985, \textit{olim} Semitic Museum 47). At the moment the contents of \textit{Syr.2} are known only on the basis of the few remarks by CASEY (1933) 6-26. Otherwise, according to DESREUMAUX (1993) 66, the Syriac mss. would belong to different families of the same recension, mainly characterized by the transposition of the narrative of the AP\textit{P}'s discovery to the end of the Vision. The critical edition of the Syriac versions is being carried on by Alain DESREUMAUX.

\textsuperscript{9} JAMES (1893) 1-42, SILVERSTEIN (1935) and (1976), who really postulates the existence of two independent Latin versions, but see PIOVANELLI (1993) 53-54, CARROZZI (1994), and now SILVERSTEIN-HILHORST (1997).

\textsuperscript{10} CANT 209, PIOVANELLI (1993) 36.

\textsuperscript{11} LELOIR (1986).
pared with the chapters of the Greek secondary text (Gr.2) edited by TISCHENDORF (1866), although the longer Latin text (Lat.1) edited by JAMES (1893) and, to a lesser extent, the Coptic version (Copt) edited by BUDGE (1915) are certainly more close to the original one. I will recall here the narrative structure of the ApP, as I will later refer to its arrangement to sketch the main characteristics of the Arabic version.

The narrative structure proceeds as follows:

§§ 1-2 Prologue concerning the discovery of the ApP in Tarsus;
§§ 3-6 The creation complains in front of God about men’s behaviour;
§§ 7-10 The angels report to God about men;
§§ 11-18 Paul is taken to the firmament by an angel; there he looks at the judgement of one pious and two sinners;
§§ 19-21 Paul ascends to the third sky, then comes back to the firmament;
§§ 21-31 Paul visits the promised land and the city of the saints beyond the Ocean, to the East of the inhabited land, then comes back;
§§ 31-42 Paul visits the places of the punishment, beyond the Ocean, to the West of the inhabited land;
§§ 43-44 Paul obtains the Sunday rest for the sinners;
§§ 45-51 Paul visits «in spirit» the Paradise.


In his recent article PIOVANELLI (1993) analyzed in detail recent and less recent researches on the ApP and advanced new hypothesis:

1) on the dating of the original Greek text of the ApP
2) on the mutual relation of the oldest versions.

According to Piovanelli there is no evidence of the existence of a first (lost) recension of the ApP — as it was stated by CASEY (1933) and SILVERSTEIN (1962). According to these scholars there would have been a

12) Properly, the prologue is not considered by ROSENSTIEHL (1990), who is mainly concerned with the internal consistency of Paul’s voyage.
13) The sketch is in ROSENSTIEHL (1990) 199-206, and 208 see the individuation of the first original nucleus of the ApP as §§ 11-18, 21-31, 31-42.
14) However, it must be stressed that Casey advanced his hypothesis with a substantial prudence, see Robert P. CASEY’s review of SILVERSTEIN (1935), in Journal of Biblical Literature 55 (1936) 93-95 (93): «It [the Apocalypse of Paul] was undoubtedly written in Greek but it is doubtful whether it is a product of the fourth century or of the third».
first recension of the ApP dating from the middle of the III century (240-250 A.D.), and a second recension, called the «Tarsus recension», characterized by the adding of the account of the discovery of the ApP in the city of Tarsus, Paul’s birthplace. The dating of the ApP varied according to these scholars: 388 A.D. according to CASEY (1933), the first half of the Vth century (420-431 A.D.) according to SILVERSTEIN (1962). Piovanelli demonstrates the unreliability of the alleged witnesses of Origen as a proof of the existence of an early (IIIrd c.) recension of the ApP. On the contrary, the reliability of the witnesses of Augustin (416 A.D.) and of Sozomene (443 A.D.) is confirmed. The secondary character of the longer final of the Coptic version (Copt) is stated as well. Moreover, the new witness of a late Mediaeval Spanish version (ignored up to now), which attributes the discovery of the ApP to the reign of Theodosius the elder (379-395 A.D.), contributes to establish the date of the ApP in the range between 395-416 A.D. The prologue stating the finding of the ApP in Tarsus dates from the same time as the ApP itself, and does not identify the second «Tarsus recension».

B. THE ARABIC VERSION (ARAPP)

1. PREVIOUS STUDIES ON THE ARAPP

We have till now no edition and no translation of the Arabic version of the ApP. None of the numerous scholars who have studied the ApP has taken into consideration the Arabic version, to the exception of Piovanelli, who made use of my preliminary translation of one single ms. (Bibliothèque Nationale, Par.ar.5072).

15) On the same subject Pierluigi PIOVANELLI is going to publish La découverte miraculeuse du manuscrit caché ou La fonction du Prologue dans l’Apocalypse de Paul (forthcoming).

16) The work is variously indicated in the mss. as ʾiktisāf «revelation», ʾiktisāf wa-ʾirāq [sic] «revelation and ascension», miʾrāq «ascension (ladder)», liḥšīf wa-ṣuʾūluhū ila l-ṣamāʾ «his abduction and elevation to the sky»), ḥabar wa-liḥšīf «account and abduction», qisṭah wa-ṣuʾūl «story and elevation», and more simply only as ḥabar «account»). CASEY (1933) 4 noted that materials for the Arabic version have never been collected, and gave references to Montague Rhodes JAMES, Apocrypha Anecdota. Second Series, «Texts and Studies» 5.1 (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1897), p. lxxxi, to the ms. in Homs, and to Ernst von DOBSCHÜTZ, Das Decretum Gelasianum de libris recipiendis et non recipiendis in kritischem Text herausgegeben und untersucht, «Texte und Untersuchungen» 38.4 (Hinrichs, Leipzig, 1912) 302, footnote 2.

17) I would like to express my deep and sincere gratitude to Mr. Prof. Gérard TROUPEAU, who read and revised the text of this preliminary edition.
2. THE MANUSCRIPTS

There are no less than 36 mss. witnessing the Arabic text of the ApP. Graf in GCAL I-II gave a list of 31 mss.\(^{18}\). The majority of the mss. (a number of 19) are garsūnī.

3. DATING OF THE MANUSCRIPTS

The dating of the mss. range between the IX-X c. and the XIX c. For some of the mss. the catalogues do not specify the date. See: Bodleian Library, Oxford, Ar. f. 18; Trinity College, Cambridge, R 13.49; Mingana Collection, Trustees of the Woodbrooke Settlement, Selly Oak, Birmingham, Syr. 549; Biblioteca Ambrosiana, Milano, R 15 sup.; Coptic Patriarchate, Cairo, Theol. 143; Houghton Library, Harvard University, Cambridge, Mass., Cod. 4022. Few of the mss. can be dated earlier than the XV c. See: Monastery of St. Catherine, Sinai, Ar. 461 (IX-X c.); Monastery of St. Catherine, Sinai, Ar. 531\(^{19}\) (1232 A.D.); Yabrād 16 (XII-XIII c.); Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Shath 125 (which is the oldest of the garsūnī mss., 1440 A.D.); Mingana Collection, Trustees of the Woodbrooke Settlement, Selly Oak, Birmingham, Syr. 225 (1450 A.D.).

4. MANUSCRIPTS NOT LISTED IN GCAL

The mss. which were not registered in GCAL are the following: Monastery of St. Catherine, Sinai, Ar. 531; Coptic Patriarchate, Cairo, Var. 2; Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Neofti 52; Franciscan Center of Christian Oriental Studies, Muski, Cairo, 109; Biblioteca Ambrosiana, Milano, R 15 sup.

C. THE RECENSIONS OF THE ARAPP

The two mss. examined till now belong to completely different recensions. They are found in mss. Bibliothèque Nationale, Par.ar.5072 ( = Ar.1) and Bibliothèque Nationale, Par.ar.4874 ( = Ar.2). According to the incipits and what is reported in the catalogues, it is tentatively possible to attribute a

---

\(^{18}\) 28 mss. in Graf, GCAL 1 (1944) 272-273 – 29 mss. including the mention of the ArApP in Shath, Al-Fāhris (1938) 38 – and 3 mss. in Graf, GCAL II (1947) 490.

\(^{19}\) It seems sure that this ms. preserves the ApP. Casey (1933) 4, footnote 1, had some doubts: «Codd. 447, 531, 556 of St Catherine’s Monastery in Sinai, cited by von Dobschütz, appear to contain a different work». 
total of 8, among the 36 presently known mss. of the ArAp, to 3 different recensions. On the other 28 mss. it is impossible to say something on the basis of the catalogues without a direct examination of the text.

1. AR.1

The ms. Bibliothèque Nationale, Par.ar.5072 probably comes from Iraq and dates to 1715 A.D.; the title is in garšînî (f.2) and three lines are in Syriac (f.4)\textsuperscript{20}. The ApP is found on ff.140\textsuperscript{v}-174. Besides this ms., it is possible to attribute to the same AR.1 recension the mss. Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Syr. 159, and Biblioteca Ambrosiana, Milano, R 15 sup. It is also possible that a similar, though not identical, recension, where the Vision is preceded by a narrative on Paul as a persecutor of Christians, is found in the ms. Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Shath 125 (= AR.1b).

2. AR.2

The ms. Bibliothèque Nationale, Par.ar.4874 is written in an Eastern writing (Egypt) and dates to the XIX c.\textsuperscript{21}. The ApP is found on ff.3-28\textsuperscript{r}. Besides this ms., the recension is certainly witnessed also by Bibliothèque Nationale, Par.ar.4875, which, according to the cataloguer, exhibits exactly the same text.

3. AR.3

A third recension is probably witnessed by Bibliothèque Nationale, Par.syr.232 and Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Syr. 202.

\textsuperscript{20} The ms. exhibits graphic and linguistic peculiarities very common in Christian Arabic (as well as in Middle Arabic). Alif maqṣūrah is always written as \( y \); there is normal exchange between \( z \) and \( d \) and \( g \); tā marbūṭah is written \( h \); the suffix of the II feminine person is \( -ki \) in the pronoun and \( -i \) in the verb; the verbs mediae geminæ are treated as verbs III infirmæ; nunation and article are sometimes kept in the status constructus.

\textsuperscript{21} The ms. exhibits the same graphic and linguistic peculiarities as Bibliothèque Nationale, Par.ar.5072, but it is much more incorrect than the previous one. Besides, hamzah is never written; \( t, f \) present the two points vertically or horizontally written over the basis; \( s \) is distinguished from \( z \) by two little strokes, each of them is similar to the fatha; it is almost impossible to distinguish \( \hat{t} \) and \( s \); tā marbūṭah and \( h \) are almost always written \( h \); \( t \) is often represented by tā marbūṭah; tā marbūṭah is sometimes written \( t \); there is exchange between \( f \) and \( s \); it is impossible to distinguish \( f \) and \( g \) in the central position; \( r, z, d, d, l \) when followed by \( h \) or tā marbūṭah in final position are written with a longer horizontal stroke prolonged to the left. The distinction of the genre is very weak; the demonstrative pronoun has only the masculine form hāḏū.
D. ANALYSIS OF AR.1 AND AR.2

I will try to show which are the main peculiarities of the two recensions Ar.1 and Ar.2, following the reconstruction of the narrative structure of the ApP sketched by ROSENSTIEHL (1990), the remarks on the versions by CASEY (1933), and the comments on Ar.1 by PIOVANELLI (1993).

The main differences between the two recensions are:

- **Ar.1** exhibits the following sequence of chapters: §§ 3-14, 19-21, 14-18, 22-29, 31-51, 1-2; evidently there is transposition of §§ 1-2, and §§ 19-21 are inserted in the middle of § 14; there is also a lacuna in the text (ff.166'-167').

- **Ar.2** is much shorter, almost half of Ar.1, and exhibits the following sequence of chapters: §§ 3-6, 8-10, 12-13-14-13, 15-23, 25-29, 31-49, 51. It can be considered a sort of résumé of the ApP, where otherwise all the essential elements are preserved.

1. PROLOGUE

- **Ar.1** (ff.140'-142'). The Vision is preceded by the narrative of the persecution of the Christians by Paul. The Vision happened after Paul’s conversion by Ananias in Damascus, and it is the main factor which determined Paul to begin his predication, but the moment when Paul decides to tell the story of his Vision and voyage is immediately before his death. The narrative of the Vision is preceded by an invitation of the Holy Spirit to Paul through an angel, to instruct men and to invite them to repent of their sins.  

22) As already stated, texts are transcribed according to interpunction and spellings of the mss.
and in the name of God, the Pitiful and the Merciful. We start by the help of God the Most High and by the excellency of His assistance, and we write the story of the Revelation of Paul the Apostle, let his prayer be with us, Amen. (f.141r) Oh, my brothers in Christ and my beloved in the true faith! I shall now inform you that this Apostle Paul was of an elevated family and noble by origin. This blessed was persecuting every one who mentioned the name of the Lord Jesus Christ, and was fighting in the correction of the doctrine of the Jews. When God, let His name be blessed, wished to bring him from the way of darkness and of Judaism to the light of the faith in His name, showed him the magnificence of His power. He was on the way descending from Jerusalem to Damascus, looking for those who were preaching in the name of the Lord Jesus Christ. When he saw the magnificence of the power of the Lord Jesus Christ, he believed in His holy name. He considered what was mentioned, considered the stories of the Apostles and the persecution on his part, and his conversion was through the pure disciple Ananias, in the city of Damascus. He baptized him, and named him Paul, that is serve of Christ the Nazarene. The Lord was merciful to him because of His great mercy, and captured him to life, lavished His powerful grace on him, and made him ascend up to the third sky
and showed him the places of lament and of punishment, and all the seats of the pious and of the wicked. When he realized all this, he began to proceed among the nations in every assembly. (f.141v) He preached the incarnation of the Lord Jesus Christ, and how the Jews behaved with Him, and how He suffered, was crucified, died, was buried and resurrected from the dead on the third day, and how He appeared after eight days to His pure disciples in the upstairs room [sic] of Sion, how He ascended to the sky and sat to the right of His Father in immutable glory for ever and caused the descent of the Holy Spirit on His disciples in the upper room of Sion, and how He will come back in His glory with the troops of the angels in the last day, and how He will judge the living and the dead, and will reward everyone according to his actions. Nations and peoples believed in the Lord Jesus Christ and were baptized in the name of the Lord, of the Son and of the Holy Spirit, one God. Then he contended in the preaching of Jesus Christ and wrote fourteen letters to the nations, he prevented them from committing sins and sent them to the faith and to doing good, which is the life of the souls. And he, the Apostle, underwent many times violations, punishments and beating, and was expelled from city to city for the sake of the name of the Lord Jesus Christ. And when his death and his departure from this transient world to the everlasting happiness was near, at this moment God inspired him, and the Holy Spirit instructed him through the angel (f.142r) saying: Oh Paul! Instruct men, so that they repent from their bad actions and withdraw from the condition where they are, and proceed in the way of justice and know their way to doing good, so that they become sons of God the Most High, who sent His Son and made of him an offer for them, redeemed them by His precious blood and saved them from the maladministration which had been written on their father Adam. Then Saint Paul, the Apostle, said: ...».

- Ar. 2. There is no Prologue. The incipit is as follows.

(f.3r) بسم الاب والابن والروح القدس الاله نبدي بعون الله تعالى وحسن توفيقه ينسخ سيرت بولس الرسول الذي راحا في السماء بركت صلاته تكون معا معه الله امين قال اعليمك يا اخوتي أي كن نذاما فاتني الى ملك الرب ووقف عند راسى وايقظني وقال لي يا بولس عبد يصوع المسيح الاله المجسد قلنت هاندا يا سيدي فقال ان الرب الامام ليس على لنسر مني حتى أريك ما تطلبه من الرب وكيف تكون الاعتذار وكيف تخرج أنسا البار [ms. واين] فين [ms. f.3r] ما هو الرب امّي بذلك فتجبر به العالم وتحف هم منeen [sic] الدينوتو والمحاضر المعدة نجمة الصاحبين اجمعوا يا اخوتي هذا الخبر وأصدروا اليه ولا يغفل عنه شاغل وحقيق كرم الرب الذي هو جالس عليه انه صدق وحق ولا هو بل حق وصدق فلا يعرفه الدنيا ومجاهدة فتاني اقتفت في السماء سبعت أيام عند خطاب الملكية في غشيات غشاي وحملت ولد أعلم وكاني قدمنت وفازت حياتي في الدنيا.
In the name of the Father, of the Son and of the Holy Spirit, God. We start by the help of God the Most High and the excellency of His assistance to write the story of Paul the Apostle, which he saw in the sky. Let the blessing of his prayer be with us. Amen. He said: I shall instruct you, my brothers, that I was sleeping, and the angel of the Lord came to me, he remained by my head, waked me up and said to me: Oh Paul, servant of Jesus Christ, the incarnated God. I said: Here I am, my master. He said: The Lord God sent me to you, so that you make your way with me, so that I will show you what you will ask from the Lord: how the sinners will be, and how the wicked souls will come out, and where will be (f. 173') what is (now), because the Lord ordered me this, and you will inform the world and will confirm them the truth of the inferior world and of the places prepared for all the pious. Listen, my brothers, to this story, and pay attention to it, and do not let concern enter you: really the throne on which God sits is just and true, and it is neither a dream nor bewildermnt, but true and just. Do not let the world and its beauty mislead you. I dwelt in the sky seven days. While the angels were talking to me, I lost consciousness and I was carried away, and I did not realize it: it was as if I had moved forward and had broken away from my life in the world.

2. §§ 1-2. THE DISCOVERY OF THE APP

- Ar. 1 (ff. 173'-174'). The discovery of the manuscript of the ApP is placed at the end of the text, as in Syr. 1 and Syr. 2, but after the Colophon (ff. 173'-173³). In Ar. 1 there is no «sealed marble box» where the manuscript is kept. While Lat. 1 names the consuls Theodosius and Cyngesus, Ar. 1 names only Theodosius (Taddásy), as Syr. 1 and Syr. 2 do. Theodosius sends a copy of the ApP to Jerusalem, as we find in Lat. 1 and Syr. 2.

(f. 173³) يا رب بحق اسمك القدوس العظيم ارحم عبد توهم الإيمان الخاصي الخبير السليم الذي في غير الخطبا مقيم كاتب الله المصمم طويل على ذكور الكبائر وأمرات السايين وأمرات السايين بأمر من يقول أمن يا رب العصبيين تعلّمكم يا أخوة كيف خبر هذا الإكتشاف وكيف ظهر تعلّمكم يا أخوة كيف وجد

[sic; read ملك في الحلم قابلاً] بالاسم هذا النبي والشبي الذي نجى من خلال هذا الرجل لم يبقش ان يفعل هذا الكلام [sic; read ملك في الحلم قابلاً] بالاسم هذا النبي والشبي الذي نجى من خلال هذا الرجل لم يبقش ان يفعل هذا الكلام [sic; read ملك في الحلم قابلاً] بالاسم هذا النبي والشبي الذي نجى من خلال هذا الرجل لم يبقش ان يفعل هذا الكلام

24) CASEY (1933) 26, PIOVANELLI (1993) 38, footnote 42.
(f.173'') Oh Lord! Really Your name is Holy and Magnificent! Have mercy on Your servant Tūmah, the guilty and the sinner, the miserable and the exhausted, who is steady in the sea of sins. This is the magnificent revelation. Oh God! Have mercy on the dead of the scribe, on the dead of the reader, on the dead of the listeners and on the dead of the one who says: Amen, oh God of mankind. We will make you know, oh brothers, how this revelation was revealed, and how it appeared. We will instruct you, my beloved, how was found the revelation of Paul the Apostle, who was dwelling in the city of Ṭarsūs of Šam, through intermediation of Tādāsys. There was there, in the city of Ṭarsūs, a noble man, and he was living in the house of Paul the Apostle, and for two nights the angel of the Lord appeared to him in dream, saying: Dismantle the foundations of this house, and take what you will find in the foundations. And this man did not want to do (according) to this speech, because he supposed it was a dream or a fantasy. After that, the angel of the Lord appeared to him three times. He said to him: Dismantle the foundations of this house. He fulfilled the order, and when he dismantled the foundations of the house, he found there this revelation, and everything Paul undertook and endured in this world, when he was preaching the Gospel of Our Lord Jesus Christ. He found also the document of the purchase of the house. When he found these things, (f.174') he took and envoyed them to the governor of that country, and the governor sent them to Tādāsys, and he was the Emperor. When he opened and read them, he found this revelation, kept it with himself by extraordinary care, had it written, and sent it to Jerusalem. Glory to God, the First and the Last.

- *Ar.2*. There is no reference to the discovery of a manuscript of the *ApP*.

3. **§§ 1-2 ARE COMPLETELY MISSING.**

4. **§§ 3-6. THE CREATION COMPLAINS IN FRONT OF GOD ABOUT MEN’S BEHAVIOUR**

- *Ar.1* (f.f.141'-143''). In the complaint of the natural elements the sea and the river are put together, as we have in *Syr.1* and *Syr.2*.

- *Ar.2* (f.f.3'-5''). In the complaint of the natural elements, the waters are represented only by the sea.
5. §§ 7-10. THE ANGELS REPORT TO GOD ABOUT MEN

- *Ar. I* (ff.143'-144').
- *Ar. 2* (ff.5'-6'). The mention of the time of sunset as the time when the angels report to God is absent: § 7 is completely missing.

6. §§ 11-18. PAUL IS TAKEN TO THE FIRMAMENT BY AN ANGEL; THERE HE LOOKS AT THE JUDGEMENT OF ONE PIous AND TWO SINNERS

- *Ar. I* (ff.144'-147', 149'-154'). (§ 11) As in Syr. I (Syr. 2 ?), there is an anticipation of the future narrative: we are informed that Paul ascends to the third sky, that he will visit the places of the pious and of the wicked, and that he will spend seven days in this condition (ff.144'-145'): this passage, that is found also in Syr. I (Syr. 2 ?), has been considered by ROSENSTIEHL (1990) as an improper and inconsistent addition of Syr to the original text²⁵.

"(f.144') Paul said: God made me ascend by a secret sign (f.145') to the third sky, and showed me the places of laments and of punishment, and all the places of the pious and of the wicked. I was not worth of this magnificent gift, and I dwelt in that condition seven days, moved about there and the angel of the Lord was with me, showed me all the seats and the places."

(§ 12) The angels of the favour keep in their hands crowns and the seal of the divine power (f.145'), as in Lat. I, Slav, Arm. I, Syr. 2, against Syr. I, Arm. 3 where the seal is stamped on the crowns²⁶.

"(f.145') After that I saw also two other angels, very beautiful in their aspect, and their face was brilliant and shining like the sun, wrapped with golden stripes, and they were keeping in their hands crowns and the seal of the divine power, and over them they had white clothes, and the name of the Lord was sealed over them, full of mercy and pity."

---

²⁵ ROSENSTIEHL (1990) 200, footnote 19.
²⁶ CASEY (1933) 9.
(§ 14) The soul of the pious man is invited to visit the Hell, so as to be aware of what she has escaped (f.147r): no other version of the ApP shares this peculiarity. The tradition of a visit to Hell and Paradise to be undertaken by all the souls (pious and wicked) is well attested in the Revelations of Macarius and in the Revelations of Marcus of Tarmaqā, studied by Van Lantschoot (1950)⁷⁷, and seems to be in origin a typical Egyptian element.

((f.147r) Then I listened to a magnificent voice, which said: Let her [the soul] pass to the inferior Hell so that she knows from where she is saved».

§ 14 is then interrupted (f.147v) by the insertion of §§ 19-21 (ff.147v-149v)²⁸, with Paul’s ascension to the third sky and his return to the firmament. (§ 14) After § 21 there follows a second judgement of a pious soul. This soul is probably different from the first one, as she has come out of her body in that very moment, and there is no mention of the first judgement; the soul is then delivered to Michael and sent to the Paradise (ff.149v-150r). It seems that in this case Ar. J has modified the original narrative structure by the addition of a second pious soul, maybe so as to have the judgement of a couple of pious men and a couple of sinners.

- Ar.2 (ff.6r-10r). There is no preliminary description of the angels who will take care of the sinners: § 11 is completely missing.

7. Ταρταρούχος and Τημελούχος

The angels Ταρταρούχος and Τημελούχος appear in several Apocalyptic texts, such as the Apocalypse of Peter²⁹ and the Apocryphal Apocalypse of

---


²⁸) Casey (1993) 3 noted that in Syr.2 «the account of the judgement of souls was badly confused through a disarrangement of folia in the archetype».

John, and have been definitely and thoroughly studied by Rosenstiehl (1986) who has also stated their Greek origin.

- (§ 16) In Ar. 2 (f. 9r) the soul of the wicked man is delivered to Mālāth, which seems to be a corruption of the name of the angel Τημελούχος, which is attested in Gr. 2, while in Lat. 1 we have tartaruchs.

(f. 9r) وَهُوَ نَفْسُ الْخَبِيرُ آنَثَابًا فَذُهِبَتْ إِلَى مَالُوْحٍ صَاحِبٍ

العذاب يجعلها في العذاب المؤبد، والظلام الدائم تكون هناك في يوم قيامتهم وآكفهم。

على قدر عملها خيراً.

«(f. 9r) At that moment, the Lord, let His names be blessed, said: Bring this soul to Mālāth, master of punishment. He will establish her in the eternal punishment and in the remotest darkness, let her stay there till the day of my Resurrection.»

- (§ 18) The third judged soul is delivered to Mālāth (f. 10v), that is Τημελούχος, as in Slav and Copt (Αγγέλος της Αγίας Κυρίας), but also to Tātarūs, that is Ταρταροῦς as in Gr. 2, Syr. 1, Lat. 1.

(f. 10v) وَلَكَنَّ تَنْقُدُ هَذَا إِلَى مَالُوْحٍ وَطَالِعُ عَصِيحٍ أَصَحَابِ العَذَابِ وَتَكُونُ عَنْدَهُمْ إِلَى يَوْمِ قِيَامَتِهِمْ.

«(f. 10v) But let this [the soul] be rejected to Mālāth and Tātarūs, masters of punishment, and let her be with them till the day of my Resurrection.»

- (§ 34) There is named again Mālāth (f. 15v), while Lat. 1 has angelos.
tartaruchos or angelus tartaruchus, Copt ἀγέλεως, and Gr. 2 Τιμελούς.

(f.15r) He looked at, and in that river there was a big old man, and he was immersed in the fire, and there had come Mālūh, master of punishment, and in his hand there was a lance. I said to the angel: What is this, oh my master? He said: This is a priest, and he filled himself with food and drinking, he screamed, he celebrated the mess, and he did not act according to the laws of God. Mālūh came to him with his lance of fire, which had four sides, he transfixed him by a stab, his bowels burnt, and there was no mercy.

• (§ 36) There is named again Mālūh (f.16r), but there is no mention of angelic names in the other versions.

(f.16r) He looked at, and in that river there was a big old man, and he was immersed in the fire, and there had come Mālūh, master of punishment, and in his hand there was a lance. I said to the angel: What is this, oh my master? He said: This is a priest, and he filled himself with food and drinking, he screamed, he celebrated the mess, and he did not act according to the laws of God. Mālūh came to him with his lance of fire, which had four sides, he transfixed him by a stab, his bowels burnt, and there was no mercy.

• (§ 40) Ar. 2 does not mention any name of angels, as it happens in Gr. 2. In the main ms. of Lat. 1 we find «the angel of the torments» and in the other ms. the «angello custode del Tartaro», but in Copt there is again ἀγέλεως.

8. §§ 19-21. PAUL ASCENDS TO THE THIRD SKY, THEN COMES BACK TO THE FIRMAMENT

• Ar. 1 (ff. 147-149). As I have already said, the chapters are inserted in the middle of § 14, and they interrupt the judgement of the pious soul. As in Gr. 2, Lat. 1, Slav, Syr. 1 the names of the pious men are written on the golden columns while they are still alive. After the ascension to the third sky, the angel makes Paul come out of the second sky, and shows him, from the Eastern part, the foundations of the sky which are placed upon the Ocean (ff. 148r-149v). In the other versions there is no mention of a second sky.

«(f.148r) Then the angel took me and made me come out of the second sky, and showed me the foundations of the sky from the part of the East. They are based upon a great, very magnificent see, and that is the see which surrounds the whole of the Earth».

- *Ar.2* (ff.10v-11v). Paul is placed at the foundations of the sky which are fixed upon the river which surrounds the Earth.


- *Ar.1* (ff.154r-160v). The episode is condensed in *Ar.1* as in most of the versions. It is best preserved in Copt and *Lat.1*. In *Ar.1* there is no mention of the little golden ship on which Paul is carried (§ 23). (§ 29) As in Syr.1 and Syr.2, great importance is attributed to singing Psalms at the time of Eucharist (ff.159r-160v). There is no interpretation of *Alleluia*: § 30 is completely missing.

- *Ar.2* (ff.11v-14v). The description is extremely condensed. In particular, there is no mention of the names of the four rivers of the Paradise, and there is no mention of the tree of the ascetics who looked for glory in the world: § 24 is completely missing. The inhabitants of the Paradise are very briefly described. There is no interpretation of *Alleluia*, as in *Ar.1*: § 30 is completely missing. After the reference to *Alleluia* there is a lacuna, as the text abruptly exhibits the description of the infernal punishments.

10. §§ 31-42. PAUL VISITS THE PLACES OF THE PUNISHMENTS, BEYOND THE OCEAN, TO THE WEST OF THE INHABITED LAND

- *Ar.1* (ff.160v-167v). The description of the punishments is enriched in § 40 by three additional categories of sinners (ff.165r⁺⁺⁺): false virgins: they are suspended and are vortically revolved; fornicators: they are crushed and devoured by a huge reptile; greedy and impure priests, who administered Eucharist: they are burnt around a big bread whose color is like blood. *Ar.1* shares these supplementary categories of sinners with *Arm.1*³⁸. This could be

an important clue to a strict relationship between Ar. 1 and Arm. 1 through a common Syriac intermediary, probably a Jacobite recension, close to Syr.2.

Then I saw the angels, and they were leading women and men, and they kept them tied by their hair and their teeth (?) in that wheel, and there came the noise of the wheel like the noise of thunder, and the wheel was going and revolving round them, and they were suffering the most bitter punishment, until they could not ask for mercy from God. Then I asked the angel: Which was the sin of these, oh my master, that they are punished by this bitter punishment? He said to me: These are those who were proclaiming among the people they were virgin, and they were lying in what they said. Really they did that only in order to be praised by the men, and this is their reward for what they did. Then I saw another seat, and in it there was a huge reptile. I saw that reptile, and it opened its mouth and swallowed a lot of men until when they had come to die (!), it started again to tear them, and they were (out) of its mouth. The face of that reptile was very terrible, and fire came out (f.165') of its face, and it punished men by the bidding of his tongue. Then I asked the angel: What did these do, so that they were committed to this reptile, and it punished them? He said: These were fornicating and defiling their bodies, and they were to take the body of Our Lord Christ, and his pure blood, and they did not fear the last day, and because of that they are in the most terrible punishment.
Then I saw another seat, and in that place there was a bread like the bread for the Eucharist, and the colour of that bread was like mixed with blood, and there were a lot of ministers and laymen, and fire was strongly burning on them, and the voice of their yell and their moaning was coming like the thunder. Then I said to the angel: Who are these? He said: These are the priests who devoted themselves to eating, drinking, fornication and disobedience, and they set about communicating Eucharist, and did not stop that until their hour came, and this is their reward.

There is lacuna between f.166v and f.167v (ff.166v-167v are white), so that there is no description of the sinners closed in the stinking well of the seven seals.39

- Ar.2 (ff.14v-20v). The text abruptly describes those who are immersed in the infernal river up to the knees, without any introduction.

11. §§ 43-44. PAUL OBTAINS THE SUNDAY REST FOR THE SINNERS40

- Ar.1 (ff.167v-169v). The rest is conceded for every Sunday.

- Ar.2 (ff.20v-22v). As in Ar.1, the rest is accorded for every Sunday.

12. §§ 45-51. PAUL VISITS «IN SPIRIT» THE PARADISE

- Ar.1 (ff.169v-173v). (§ 45) In the Paradise Paul sees three different trees, but the last of them is only mentioned, and not characterized in any way (ff.169v-170v). No special emphasis is put on the tree placed in the garden, where the Holy Spirit rested.

- Ar.2 (ff.22v-28v).

13. THE OIL OF MERCY

(§ 45) In the Paradise the angel shows to Paul three different trees (ff.23v-24v): the tree where the Holy Spirit rested, the tree of Adam’s disobedience, as in Ar.1, and a third tree, with seven shining stars: this tree is flowing with oil, the Oil of Mercy, which was asked for by Seth at the time of Adam’s death. The other versions have no mention of a tree flowing with oil: Lat.1 and Copt identify the tree with the tree of life, and Gr.2, Copt and

---

39) PIOVANELLI (1993) 30, footnote 19 thinks that the omission of Paul’s visit to the stinking well may be due to the rejection of the punishment of some heresies.
40) The motif was first studied by Arturo GRAF, Il riposo dei dannati, in Miti, leggende e superstizioni del Medioevo (Torino, 19257 [repr. Mondadori, Milano, 1984, quoted here]), pp. 151-166.
Slav add that it is guarded by Cherubim and Seraphim. The description of the third tree in Ar.2 seems to recall an ancient and widespread apocryphal tradition: a tree flowing with oil is described in the Slavonic Book of the Mysteries of Enoch, § VIII. 5\textsuperscript{41}, and a tree flowing with the Oil of Mercy, which is asked for by Seth, is present at length in the Latin Life of Adam and Eve, §§ 36, 40-4\textsuperscript{2}, in the corresponding Greek Apocrypha of Moses, § 13, and in the Armenian Penitence of Adam, §§ 36(9), 41(13)-42(13)\textsuperscript{3, 43}.

«(f.24)» He showed me another magnificent tree in the Paradise, and he said to me: This tree (has) now seven stars each of them is shining by a magnificent shining, and an oil comes out of it, which is called Oil of Mercy, because Adam went (f.24) down the earth, and death was present to him, and Seth his son came out, the voice of Paradise (?), and asked a part for himself. «(f.24)»

- Among the people met by Paul, there is no mention of Noah: § 50 is


\textsuperscript{42} M.D. JOHNSON, Life of Adam and Eve, in CHARLESWORTH (1985) 249-295 (comments 254-256, translation 272, 274-275), see in particular 254 on the distinction in the text of an earthly and an heavenly Paradise: the tree is in the earthly Paradise, while the Paradise is located in the third heaven. See now also Daniel A. BERTRAND, La Vie grecque d’Adam et Ève, «Recherches intertextuelles» 1 (Paris, Librairie Maisonneuve, 1987), reviewed by Émile PUECH, in Revue Biblique 95 (1988) 584-585, and J. MOSSAY, in Le Muséon 101 (1988) 437-438, with further references. As for the Arabic version, which is not to be identified with this text according to STONE (1981) VII, see GRAF, GCAL I (1944) 201-203, and now Antonio BATTISTA and Bellarmino BAGATTI, OFM, Il combattimento di Adamo, «Studium Biblicum Franciscanum», Collectio minor 29 (Franciscan Printing Press, Jerusalem, 1982).

\textsuperscript{43} STONE (1981) XIV-XVI (comments), and 10-11 (translation) «Seth, man of God: Do not labour to supplicate for the oil which issues forth from the tree — that oil of joy — to anoint your father Adam. This cannot be now: but then, at that time when the years of the end are filled and completed, then the beloved Christ will come to resurrect Adam’s body, because of his sins which took place. He will come to the Jordan and be baptized by him, and when he will come forth from the water, then Michael will come and anoint the new Adam with the oil of joy. Then, after that, it shall happen in the same fashion to all the wild beasts of the earth, who will arise in resurrection and be worthy of entering the Garden. I shall anoint them with that oil». See also E.C. QUINN, Quest of Seth for the Oil of Life (University of Chicago Press, Chicago, 1962) [non vidi].

\textsuperscript{44} The general meaning of the passage can be understood, but the Arabic text exhibits a number of difficulties, and is affected by corruptions. The translation is purely tentative.
completely missing, although Noah was briefly mentioned in § 47 (f.25'). At the end of the Vision (f.28') we are very briefly informed, in one sentence, that Paul is made to ascend again by the angel, and is finally taken to Jerusalem. This very short information is very important, as among all the versions of the ApP only in Copt Paul ascends again (in Copt it is specified: to the third heaven), visits for the third time the Paradise, and comes back to the Mount of the Olives – a very conventional theme in apocalyptic contexts – where it is also likely, in Copt, that the Vision began.

«(f.28') Then he [the angel] took me, caused on me ascension, and took me in veils, and I became like a dead until he made me arrive up to the Earth, the earth of Jerusalem the inferior».

E. CONCLUSIONS: THE TENTATIVE VORLAGE OF THE TWO ARABIC VERSIONS

The short analysis clearly indicates that the two Arabic versions Ar.1 and Ar.2 descend from different recensions of the ApP. Ar.1 descends from a Syriac one, probably Syr.2. As for Ar.2 it is more difficult to specify its Vorlage, but it is likely that it shares some affinities with the Greek (Gr.2) and Coptic (Copt) versions.

1. AR.1

There is a number of clues to a Syriac Vorlage. In the final admonition there is mention of the Virgin Mary by the Syriac expression Mrtmyrm (f.174'), although the originally Syriac expression can be found in the colophons of later Coptic mss. as well. The evidence that the narrative of the discovery of the ApP was transposed to the end of the Vision is very important, even if we have to stress that in Ar.1 this episode is preceded by the Colophon, so that the narrative could also be a later addition to a primitive recension which had no narrative of the discovery. Besides, there are other elements: (§ 11) the anticipation of the future narrative, (§ 29) the particular emphasis on singing Psalms at the time of Eucharist. Other elements indicate a Vorlage close to the Jacobite Syr.2 recension: (§ 12) the seal of the divine power, (§ 40) the additional categories of sinners shared with Arm. I, which

can be best explained by supposition of a common Syriac Vorlage. Only in the mention of the visit to Hell of the pious soul there is the insertion of a tradition which has no parallel in the versions of the ApP.

2. AR.2

It seems difficult to suppose a Syriac Vorlage, as there is no specific affinity with Syr.1 or Syr.2 (as far as we know). First of all, there is no narrative of the discovery, which is the main tract of the two Syriac versions, even if this element must not be emphasized at the present phase of the research, when we almost completely ignore the textual tradition of the ArApP. The absence of the narrative could be due to an accident in the late history of the family of mss. to which Ar.2 belongs. The names of the angels of punishment Ṭāḷātōs (§ 18) and Mālūḥ (§§ 16, 18, 34, 36) in particular, seem to indicate a relationship with Gr.2, where both of them are mentioned (Ὑμέλον ταῦτα ταύτα and Μαῖλος) and/or with Copt, where only Ὕμελον θεοῦ (Ἀγγελοῦ θεοῦ) is mentioned. Even in this case we must be prudent. The names of these angels are so common in other Apocryphal texts that they could also be an addition to a primitive Arabic text where there was no mention of angels’ names, and not the survival of an old tract: we have to keep in mind that in the case of the «Oil of mercy» (zayt al-raḥmah) Ar.2 introduces an apocryphal tradition which was not certainly part of the oldest ApP. (Otherwise, a factor of minor probability in the late assumption of the angelic names is the particular form assumed by Ὕμελον ταῦτα ταύτα; Mālūḥ). A further element of a tentative connection of Ar.2 with Copt is the brief mention of the final ascension of Paul and of the end of his voyage in Jerusalem (§ 51), but, again, Jerusalem is a conventional element as a scenery of Visions, and the final ascension can simply be the final return of Paul from the Paradise to the Earth.

F. DESIDERATA.

OTHER TEXTS RELATED WITH THE APP. THE DERSĀNA MIKĀ'EL

The main desideratum in the future research on the ArApP, I am perfectly aware, is obviously a complete critical edition of the text, and indeed these preliminary remarks only intend to testify to the willingness of carrying on the work. In particular, it is possible that further researches may show the existence of other textual types.

1. THE VISION OF PSEUDO-ATHANASIUS

Another main desideratum to be considered is certainly the thorough
examination of the Arabic texts which are more or less strictly related to the ArApP. First of all, the Vision of Pseudo-Athanasius, which is completely derived from the ApP: it contains all the main narrative elements of the ApP, included the scene of Mercy through intercession of Michael the archangel.

2. THE HOMILY OF TIMOTHEUS IN THE ETHIOPIAN DERSĀNA MIKĀʾEL

A relationship with the ApP can be found also in the Homily on St. Michael attributed to Timotheus of Alexandria, which is translated from Arabic in the Ethiopic Dersāna Mikāʾel, a collection of Homilies and Miracles in honour of St. Michael, where it is attributed to Damāṭewos liqsa ṣəpāsāt zaʾ Ellaʾeskenderyā. The Homily is to be read on the 12th of the month of Ḥedār. It tells how the Patriarch Damāṭewos went to Jerusalem to pray the venerable Cross and the Sepulchre of Jesus Christ. He entered the house of Mary, the mother of John «who is called Mark the Evangelist>, and found there a holy book, written by John the Evangelist. In the book there was written how the angels ravished John «in a Vision» (barāʾey) to the sky, to visit the infernal torments and to assist at St. Michael’s intercession in favour of the souls of the sinners. The tradition of John as concurrent with Paul in the Vision of the afterlife is also corroborated by the Ethiopic Apocalypse of the Virgin, where the same Vision attributed to Paul in the ApP is told by the Virgin herself to «John the son of Zebedee» 50. This may be merely due to a late Ethiopian internal development, but the question needs to be carefully investigated.

46) GRAF, GCAL I (1944) 276-277.
47) GRAF, GCAL I (1944) 543 (§ d), and Carl D.G. MÜLLER, Die Engelrehe der kop- tischen Kirche (Harrassowitz, Wiesbaden, 1959) 161-162, with bibliography on footnote 951. See now LUCCHIESI (printing).
50) CHAÎNE (1909) 53 (text), 45 (translation).
BIBLIOGRAPHICAL ABBREVIATIONS


CANT. Maurice GEERARD, Clavis Apocryphorum Novi Testamenti (Brepols, Turnhout, 1992).


LUCCHESI (printing). Enzo Lucchesi, Une (Pseudo)-Apocalypse d'Athanae en copte, being printed in Analecta Bollandiana.


RICCIOTTI (1933). Giuseppe RICCIOTTI, Apocalypsis Pauli syriace, in Orientalia n.s. 2 (1933) 1-25 and 120-149.


SIMAIKA, Cairo (1939-1942). Marcus SIMAIKA PASHA and Yassa ʿABD AL-MAŠĪḤ EFFENDI, Catalogue of the Coptic and Arabic Manuscripts in the Coptic Museums, the Patriarchate, the Principal Churches of Cairo and Alexandria and the Monasteries of Egypt, 2 voll. (Government Press,
Bûlû, Cairo, 1939-1942).


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>N.</th>
<th>Manuscript</th>
<th>A/K</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>FL/Pp.</th>
<th>GCAL</th>
<th>R</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Monastery of St. Catherine, Sinai, Ar. 461</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>IX-X c.</td>
<td>88'-94'</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Monastery of St. Catherine, Sinai, Ar. 531</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>1232</td>
<td>1-30</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Yabrūd 16</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>XII-XIII c.</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Sbath 125</td>
<td>K</td>
<td>1440</td>
<td>§ 2</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Ar.1b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Mingana Collection, Trustees of the Woodbrooke Settlement, Selly Oak, Birmingham, Syr. 222</td>
<td>K</td>
<td>1450</td>
<td>133'-159'</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Mingana Collection, Trustees of the Woodbrooke Settlement, Selly Oak, Birmingham, Syr. 364</td>
<td>K</td>
<td>1550</td>
<td>1'46'</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

51) NOTICE. A/K indicates if the ms. is written in Arabic (A) or in Syriac (garšûnî) writing (K). Y/N indicates if the ms. was listed in GCAL (Y) or not (N). R indicates the recension, among those which have been identified, to which the ms. belongs (Ar.1, Ar.1b, Ar.2 or Ar.3).

52) [1. Monastery of St. Catherine, Sinai, Ar. 461, IX-X c., GCAL] DUNLOP GIBSON, Sinaí (1894) 90 (461) «γ. Αποκάλυψις του Ἀγίου Παύλου. Εὐλογεῖς κατ' άρχην καὶ δευ- 


54) [3. Yabrūd 16, XII-XIII c., GCAL] NASRALLAH, Yabroûd (1940) 103-105.

55) [4. Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Sbath 125, K, 1440, § 2, GCAL, Ar.1b] Sbath, Sbath (1928) 70, incipit και ἤλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἡλίου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καὶ ἦλθεν ἐκ τοῦ ἀ

56) [5. Mingana Collection, Trustees of the Woodbrooke Settlement, Selly Oak, Birmingham, Syr. 225, K, 1450, 133'-159', GCAL] MINGANA, Syriac and Garšûnî (1933) 467-519. West Syrian hand. About 1 f. missing at the beginning, explicit (f.159').

57) [6. Mingana Collection, Trustees of the Woodbrooke Settlement, Selly Oak, Bir-
7 Mingana Collection, Trustees of the Woodbrooke Settlement, Selly Oak, Birmingham, Syr. 401
K 1550 165°-203° Y ?

8 Mingana Collection, Trustees of the Woodbrooke Settlement, Selly Oak, Birmingham, Syr. 299
K 1551 51°-85° Y ?

9 Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin, Syr. 242
K 1566 4°-34° Y ?

10 Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Syr. 159
K 1628 330°-343° Y Ar.1

mingham, Syr. 367, K, 1550, 1°-46°, GCAL] MINGANA, Syriac and Garsînî (1933) 666-668. West Syrian hand. 3 ff. at the beginning and subscription are missing. كمل اكتشاف بولس الرسول

58) [7. Mingana Collection, Trustees of the Woodbrooke Settlement, Selly Oak Birmingham, Syr. 401, 1550, 165°-203°, GCAL] MINGANA, Syriac and Garsînî (1933) 714-717. West Syrian hand. Incomplete at the end. اكتشاف واعزاج بولس الرسول إلى السما

59) [8. Mingana Collection, Trustees of the Woodbrooke Settlement, Selly Oak, Birmingham, Syr. 299, K, 1551, 51°-85°, GCAL] MINGANA, Syriac and Garsînî (1933) 577-578. West Syrian hand. اكتشاف بولس الرسول


| 11 | Šarfeh, Syr. 11/662 | K | xvii c. | (§ 12) | Y | ? |
| 12 | Šarfeh, Ar. 2/3463 | A | xvii c. | (§ 2) | Y | ? |
| 13 | Mingana Collection, Trustees of the Woodbrooke Settlement, Selly Oak, Birmingham, Syr. 263⁶⁴ | K | 1650 | 98°-110⁰ | Y | ? |
| 14 | Monastery of St. Mena, Cairo, Var. 2⁶⁵ | A | xvii c. | 3°-33⁰ | N | ? |
| 15 | Bibliothèque Nationale, Par.syr.232⁶⁶ | K | xvii c. | 196°-205⁰ | Y | Ar.3 |
| 16 | Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Syr. 202⁶⁷ | K | 1672 | 139°-149⁰ | Y | Ar.3 |
| 17 | Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Neofiti 52⁶⁸ | K | 1676-77 | 87°-123⁰ | N | ? |
| 18 | Homs⁶⁹ | A | xvii-xviii c. | 49°-60 | Y | ? |
| 19 | Bibliothèque Nationale, Par.ar.5072⁷⁰ | A | 1715 | 140°-174 | Y | Ar.1 |

---

63) [12. Šarfeh, Ar. 2/34, xvii c., § 2, GCAL] Armalet, Charfet (1937) 324-325.
66) [15. Bibliothèque Nationale, Par.syr.232. K. xvii c., 196°-205°, GCAL, Ar.3] Zotenberg, Syriques (1874) 178. According to the cataloguer, it is a recension different from Tischendorf’s (1866) Greek text, and from the Syriac texts of Perkins (1866) and ASSEMANUS-ASSEMANUS, Syriaci (1759) 374, 472. Incipit: Basm al-ab... تكبيع مراح أمي حب بولوص. رسول مسيحي مسيحي إلى غرب مرتبط به بعله ومحبه في مساحات الأدبيات.
69) [18. Homs, xvii-xviii c., 49°-60, GCAL] Paul Pleters, Une version arabe de la Passion de sainte Cathérine d’Alexandrie, in Analecta Bollandiana 26 (1907) 5-52 (12). On ff. 49° (or 50°) there are «Révélations d’un ange à S. Paul sur l’état des damnés dans la vie future». Ms. incomplete at the beginning and at the end.
70) [19. Bibliothèque Nationale, Par.ar.5072, 1715, 140°-174, GCAL, Ar.1] Troupeau,
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Author/Details</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Mingana Collection, Trustees of the Woodbrooke Settlement, Selly Oak, Birmingham, Syr. 446</td>
<td>K</td>
<td>1750</td>
<td>260°-286°</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Coptic Patriarchate, Cairo, Theol. 244</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>XVIII c.</td>
<td>70°-97°</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Bibliothèque Orientale, Beirut, 618</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>XVIII c.</td>
<td>99-122</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Bibliothèque Orientale, Beirut, 622</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>XVIII c.</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Bibliothèque Orientale, Beirut, 623</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>XVIII c.</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Šarfeh, Ar. 6/30</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>1824</td>
<td>(§ 9)</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Bibliothèque Nationale, Par.ar.4874</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>IX c.</td>
<td>3-28°</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Ar.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Bibliothèque Nationale, Par.ar.4875</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>IX c.</td>
<td>1-27°</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Ar.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Franciscan Center of Christian Oriental Studies, Muski, Cairo, 109</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>IX c.</td>
<td>114°-129°</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Mingana Collection, Trustees of the Woodbrooke Settlement, Selly Oak, Birmingham, Syr. 439</td>
<td>K</td>
<td>1901</td>
<td>1°-61°</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Šarfeh, Syr. 11/22</td>
<td>K</td>
<td>(recent)</td>
<td>(§ 2)</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


74) [23. Bibliothèque Orientale, Beirut, 622 [1150], XVIII c., GCAL] Cheikho, Bibliothèque Orientale (1926) 274-278. [«Num. de cote 1150»]. Purchased in Damascus in 1896.


76) [25. Šarfeh, Ar. 6/30, 1824, § 9, GCAL] Armalet, Charafet (1937) 377, عبر اكتشاف، نصوص الرسول إلى السما.


Istituto Universitario Orientale
Dipartimento di Studi e Ricerche
su Africa e Paesi Arabi
Pza S. Domenico Maggiore
Palazzo Corigliano
I-80134 NAPOLI

ALESSANDRO BAUSI

31 Bodleian Library, Oxford, Ar. f. 18
32 Trinity College, Cambridge, R. 13.49
33 Mingana Collection, Trustees of the Woodbrooke Settlement, Selly Oak, Birmingham, Syr. 549
34 Biblioteca Ambrosiana, Milano, R 15
35 Coptic Patriarchate, Cairo, Theol. 143
36 Houghton Library, Harvard University, Cambridge, Mass., Cod. 4022

<p>| | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Bodleian Library, Oxford, Ar. f. 18</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Trinity College, Cambridge, R. 13.49</td>
<td>K</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Mingana Collection, Trustees of the Woodbrooke Settlement, Selly Oak, Birmingham, Syr. 549</td>
<td>K</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Biblioteca Ambrosiana, Milano, R 15 sup.</td>
<td>K</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Coptic Patriarchate, Cairo, Theol. 143</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Houghton Library, Harvard University, Cambridge, Mass., Cod. 4022</td>
<td>K</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


83) 32. Trinity College, Cambridge, R. 13.49, K, 14r-29v, GCAL] PALMER, Trinity College (1870) 130-137 (132-133). Incomplete at the beginning. Incipit: "And the angel said unto them, I am the angel of the Lord to whom the angel of the Lord said, 'Go and tell . . ."


