

VBI EST ILLVD...?

The Dictionaries seem to be ignorant of this phrase and its peculiar use in later Latin, and it has not been remarked on, so far as I know, except in the indices to several of the volumes in the *Vienna Corpus scriptorum ecclesiasticorum*. Its use may be seen at once from these examples :

Ps. AMBR., *Serm.*, 55, 11, *si dicas mihi* : « *quid honoras in carne iam resoluta* » ; ... *ubi est illud quod ipsa Veritas loquitur per prophetam* : « *Pretiosa* », inquit, « *in conspectu Domini est mors sanctorum eius* » ?

FASTIDIUS, *Vit. Chr.*, 13, *nam si Deus peccatorem non punit, ubi est illud propheticum*...?

AVG., *Ep.*, 22, 3, *quam foeditatem, si tantum flagitiosa et non etiam sacrilega esset, quibuscumque tolerantiae viribus sustentandam putaremus. Quamquam ubi est illud quod, cum multa vitia enumerasset idem apostolus...*, *ita conclusit ut diceret*...?

Obviously *ubi est illud* is a phrase of challenging : « What about...? » ; « What do you make of...? » ; it serves to introduce, against an opponent, an argument either in Scriptural terms or based on Scripture, and hence a trump card, final and unanswerable. It would seem to belong entirely to Christian Latin, though further information on its use is desirable.

Souter's index to the Pseudo-Augustinian *Quaestiones* (= C. S. E. L., vol. L) gives an example from Hilary and one from Jerome, and shows the existence of other forms of the phrase (*ubi illud quod, ubi est quod, ubi erit quod*). Augustine has also one of these (less regular?) forms : *Ep.* 93, 26 (the Jews will challenge Christians) *ubi est quod Paulus noster ecclesiam intellegit*...?

The forms and the meaning are sufficiently clear; it only remains to complete the list of examples and to ascertain whether the phrase survives in medieval Latin. Besides the authors cited above, Lucif. Calar. (e. g., p. 36, 7 Hartel), Optatus (2, 18), Peter Chrysologus (*saepissime*; see my article in the *Journal of Theological Studies*, XXII, [1921], p. 256), Siric. I Pap. (*Ep. I ad Himer.*, 12) and others round this date employ it. For the later, medieval period I have, as yet, no examples, but perhaps other students may know of some.

J. H. BAXTER.
