

ARITHMETIC RHYTHMS IN LATIN LETTERS *

This essay considers five Latin texts that exhibit the rhythms of the *cursus* — *planus*, *tardus*, *uelox*, *medius*, *trispondiacus*, and *dispondeus dactylicus*, and the ratios of cosmic and harmonic theory by which ancient and mediaeval men believed that God had created the universe — symmetry, 1:1; *duplus* or *duple*, 2:1; the golden section or extreme and mean ratio, 0.61803 and 0.38197; *hemiolus* or *sesquialter*, 11/2:1 or 3:2; *epitritus* or *sesquitercian*, 11/3:1 or 4:3; *epogdous* or *sesquioctave*, 11/8:1 or 9:8; and 1/9 and 8/9. Though all five works exhibit identical rules of a single tradition of epistolary composition, they are idiosyncratic, utterly distinct in detail and style: ' the first by Fulbert bishop of Chartres to Adalbero bishop of Laon about the death of one subdean of Chartres and the murder of another, the second by Anselm prior of Bec and later archbishop of Canterbury about discovery of his ontological argument for the existence of God, the third by Peter Abaelard about the history of his own calamities, the fourth by Peter the Venerable abbot of Cluny to Heloise niece of Fulbert canon of Notre Dame about the death of Peter Abaelard, and the fifth by Abaelard's pupil John of Salisbury, later bishop of Chartres, to his brother Richard about the tribulations of Thomas Becket archbishop of Canterbury. The first was written about A.D. 1018-20, the second about 1077-8, the third about 1132, the fourth about 1142, the fifth in June or July 1166.

* I owe thanks to Leofranc Holford-Strevens for helpful criticism and to Alan Piper for collation of the Durham manuscript of Fulbert's Letter.

1. For accounts of the tradition of which these writers are articulate exponents see D. R. HOWLET *The Book of Letters of Saint Patrick the Bishop; The Celtic Latin Tradition of Biblical Style; The English Origins of Old French Literature; British Books in Biblical Style; Cambro-Latin Compositions* (Dublin: Four Courts 1994, 1995, 1996, 1997, 1998), and articles in *Mittellateinisches Jahrbuch* XXVIII (1993) and XXXI (1996), *ALMA* LI-LV (1993-7), and *Peritia* VIII-XII (1994-8).

I. FULBERTI EPISCOPI CARNOTENSIIUM EPISTOLA XXIX

To determine a detail of orthography one relies upon two of Fulbert's poems, texts numbered 151 and 155 by the most recent editor.² In the first two lines of the *Rithmus de sententiis philosophorum de summo bono* Behrends prints

Inter illa quae profani bona putant maxime
Solent amare quietem iunctam opulentiae.

In lines 13-5 of the *Rithmus de Trinitate* Behrends prints

Quodque Deus nasciturus esset matre uirgine
Idem ante Gabrihelem iussus est predicere
Talis porro decet ortus auctorem munditiae.

The rhymes in Fulbert's rhythmic verses suggest that he wrote

Inter illa que profani bona putant maxime
Solent amare quietem iunctam opulentie.

Quodque Deus nasciturus esset matre uirgine
Idem ante Gabrihelem iussus est predicere
Talis porro decet ortus auctorem munditie.

One sees and hears rhymes of *que* with *amare*, *maxime* with *opulentie*, *matre* with *pre-*, and *uirgine* with *predicere* and *munditie* only by writing the Classical diphthong *ae* as *e*. Let us observe this orthographic convention in Fulbert's Letter 29, written between 21 February 1018/9 and 5 September 1019/20 to Bishop Adalbero of Laon, relating the murder of Evrard subdean of Chartres.³ In this and the following analyses I have arranged the text *per cola et commata*, numbered the sentences and the lines, marked the rhythms of the cursus, and suggested possible rhymes with italics and alliteration with solid underlining, drawing attention to other notable words with dotted underlining. Capital letters and punctuation marks in boldface represent features of Durham Cathedral MS B.II.11, folio 120r-v.

2. F. BEHREND'S ed. & transl. *The Letters and Poems of Fulbert of Chartres*, Oxford Medieval Texts (Oxford : Clarendon Press 1976) pp. 264, 270.

3. *Ibid.* pp. 52-6. I have adopted the Durham MS reading *ergo* for BEHREND'S reading *ego* in line 41.

ADALBERONI CLARO LAUDUNENSII PRESULI
FULBERTUS . CARNOTENSII SACERDOS.

De grandi iniuria nobis facta conquerimur apud tē magne páter .	1
quem ex debito caritatis et officii talia curare oportet .	
Causa uero huiusmodi . est .	2
Quodam ecclesie nostre subdecáno defúncto	3
petiit a nobis Rodulfus Silnectensis episcopus dari sibi aut fratri suo mi-	
nistérium eius .	5
Nos autem respondimus non conuenire sibi eo quod 1º episcopus . esset .	4
neque fratri suo etate adhuc et moribus inmatúro .	
Tunc elegimus de numero sacerdotum nostrorum ad illud officium	
Eurárdum .	5
quendam scientem ac religiosum uírum .	
Quod factum predictus Rodulfus materque et frater ipsius ádeo inuidé-	
runt .	6 10
ut sancto uiro coram pluribus qui testes inde sunt terribília minaréntur .	
Et dictum fácto non cáruit .	
Venerunt enim de ciuitate Silnectis ad nostram quidam ex domesticis	
eorum sic necessari .	7
ut absentiam illorum nec per unum diem ignorare potúerint ;	
Qui interdiu quídem latuérunt .	8 15
sed profunda nocte egressi . sanctum illum presbiterum more solito	
ueniéntem ad ecclésiám .	
quasi lupum rabidum lanceis . falcastris et gladiis in ipso atrio principalis	
ecclésie trucidáruť .	
Clerici autem eius qui expeditum dominum tarde secuti sunt : inuenerunt	
eum [? l. éum inuénérunt]	9
adhuc extrema uerba protomartyris STÉPhaNi pròferéntem .	
Porro carnifices 8º presidio noctis incogniti : iam diffúgerant .	10 20
et cui crimen hoc intenderetur érat incértum .	
cum quidam propter minas preteritas domum Rodulfi que erat apud nos	
suspéctam habéntes .	
repererunt in ea uernaculum quendam uestes suas et calciamenta lóta	
siccántem .	
Ex quo signo 9º coniectura incepta . cum ad causam huius lauacri dicendam	
homo ácrius úrgerétur :	11
se facto 11º de quo agebatur affuisse confessus est . Socios prodidit . et	
ordinem rei géste expósuit . 18	25
Nos denique totum hoc áltius perscrutantes : pro certo ita ésse compérimus	12
Comperimus inquam inuidie liuorem fraudem malitie . sacrilegii nefas	
crudele . cruentum et singuláre fácinus	
in occisione sanctíssimi sacerdótis .	13

<u>Nunc ergo tanta causa quia iudicatio eius obscura non est : solam ut uides ultionem expostulat .</u>	14
<u>Sed cum iuris sit ad utilitatem rei publice cunctos punire maléficos :</u>	15 30
<u>illos tamen uehementius exturbare necesse est qui ?! in Deum et sanctos eius tam impie tamque crudéliter audent .</u>	
<u>Quid enim mali ulterius . uel certe eque magnum excogitari queat ?</u>	16
<u>Multo nimirum leuius illi complices Chore peccasse uidentur . quos tamen iudicio Dei terra uiuos obsorbuit .</u>	17
<u>Nam si illi sanctos Dei contempserant : non utique trucidarant .</u>	18
<u>Quod si tales socordia uel iniquitas iudicium reliquerit inpunitos .</u>	19 35
<u>cum hoc facere conspirare sit in contumeliam Dei et exponere seruos eius ad cedem .</u>	
<u>quid restat . nisi ut ipsius summi iudicis ira deseuiens et hos et illos inaudita mortis atrocitate disperdat ?</u>	
<u>Pro inde nobis quibus idem Dominus ecclesie sue tribunalia commisit .</u>	20
<u>ad prime necessarium .est. regem ⁸p nostrum nosque inuicem modis omnibus excitare .</u>	
<u>ne repente feriamur in huiusmodi socordia ocsitantes .</u>	40
<u>Quod ergo te facere deprecor magne pater cui Deus bene suadendi copiam incomparabilem dedit .</u>	21
<u>simulque ut ipse mecum predictos maleficos citra legitimam satisfactionem excommunices .</u>	
<u>quos tamen usque in finem a communione priuandos esse non nescis —</u>	
<u>Vale</u>	22 44

The Salutation contains 7 words, which divide by sesquitertian ratio at 4 and 3, at the name of the author, | *Fulbertus*. The 26 syllables divide by the same ratio at 15 and 11, at | *Fulbertus*. The 63 letters divide by the same ratio at 36 and 27, in *Fulbertus*.

The text of the letter proper contains 22 (xxii) sentences, 44 (xxxiiii) lines, and 444 (ccccxxxiiii) words. ⁴ From the beginning to *te magne pater* inclusive there are 10 words and from *te ... magne pater* inclusive to the end there are 34 words, together 44. There are 44 words between *Rodulfus* 5 and *predictus Rodulfus* 10, among which the central 22nd word is *suo* 7, that is *Rodulfi*. The former 22 words divide by extreme and mean ratio at 14 and 8, at *sibi* 6, that is *Rodulfo* and at *eius* 5, that is *subdecani*. The latter 22 words divide

4. Note in these numbers omission of the intervening roman numerals L and V. For play with the number 444 by other writers see D. R. HOWLETT 'Aldhelm and Irish Learning' *ALMA LII* (1994) pp. 37-75 at 51-3, *The Celtic Latin Tradition of Biblical Style* p. 151, *British Books in Biblical Style* pp. 119-21, *The English Origins of Old French Literature* pp. 132-5.

by the same ratio at *Eurardum* 8, successor of the dead subdean. After *predictus Rodulfus* 10 the 111th word is *Rodulfo* 22.

After *factum* 10 the 22nd word is *facto* 12. The 222nd word of the letter is *facto* 25.⁵

There are 45 words from *fratri suo* 5 to *frater ipsius* 10 inclusive, which divide by extreme and mean ratio at 28 and 17, at *fratri suo* 7, the 17th word from *fratri suo* 5 inclusive.

Fulbert refers at the symmetrical centre (reckoned by sentences and lines and words) to the murder, twice at 9:8 to the sign by which the murder was discovered, at 2:1 and the golden section to the murderers, at 1/9 to the instigator, and at 8/9 to the king who must punish him.

The 44 lines divide by sesquitercian ratio at 25 and 19. The only word repeated immediately at the end of one line and the beginning of the next occurs at the 19th line from the end.

II. ANSELMI PROOEMIUM IN PROSLOGION

The text of the *Prooemium* to Anselm's *Proslogion* is that edited by M. J. Charlesworth.⁶ Capital letters and punctuation marks in boldface represent features of Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Rawlinson A.392, folio 31.

POSTQUAM **Q**UPUSCULUM QUODDAM UELUT 'Exemplum meditandi de
 ratióne fidéi' 1 a
Qoigentibus me precibus quorundam fratrum . b
In persona alicuius tacite secum ratiocinando quae nesciat **I**nuestigán-
 tis : **Q**didí : a

5. For play with the numbers 11, 111, 1111, and 2, 22, 222 by other writers see D. R. HOWLETT 'Laidcenn's *Egloga* and *Lorica*' and '*Adelphus Adelpa Mater*' in 'Five Experiments in Textual Reconstruction and Analysis' *Peritia* IX (1995) pp. 1-50 at 6-18 and 30-48, 'Two Works by Aileranus Sapiens' in 'Seven Studies in Seventh-Century Texts' *Ibid.* X (1996) pp. 1-70 at 6-20, '*Vita I Sanctae Brigittae*' *Ibid.* XII (1998) pp. 1-23, *The English Origins of Old French Literature* pp. 130-1, and *Cambro-Latin Compositions* pp. 120-6, 130-40. See below p. 202 and n. 11.

6. M. J. CHARLESWORTH ed. & transl. *St. Anselm's Proslogion with a Reply on Behalf of the Fool by Gaunilo and The Author's Reply to Gaunilo* (Oxford University Press 1965, rept London & Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press 1979) pp. 102-4.

<u>considerans illud esse multorum concatenatione contextum argumentorum .</u>		b
<u>coepi mecum quaerere si forte posset inueniri unum argumentum</u>	5	b
<u>quod nullo alio ad se probandum quam se solo indigeret .</u>		c
<u>et solum ad astruendum quia Deus uere est .</u>		d
<u>et quia est summum bonum nullo alio indigens .</u>		e
<u>et quo omnia indigent ut sint et ut bene sint.</u>		d
<u>et quaecumque de diuina credimus substantia . sufficeret.</u>	10	c
<u>Ad quod cum saepe studioseque cogitationem conuenterem .</u>	2	b
<u>atque aliquando mihi uideretur iam posse capi quod quaerebam .</u>		b
<u>aliquando mentis aciem omnino fugeret :</u>		c
<u>tandem desperans uolui cessare</u>		f
<u>uelut ab inquisitione rei quam inueniri esset . impossibile.</u>	15	f
<u>Sed cum illam cogitationem ne mentem meam frustra occupando</u>	3	g
<u>ab aliis in quibus proficere possem impediret.</u>		c
<u>penitus a me uellem excludere : *</u>		h
<u>tunc magis ac magis nolenti et defendenti</u>		iiij
<u>se coepit cum importunitate quadam ingerere.</u>	20	h
<u>Cum igitur quadam die uehementer eius importunitati resistendo fati-</u>		
<u>gärer :</u>	4	k
<u>in 'll' ipso cogitationum conflictu sic se obtulit . quod desperaueram .</u>		b
<u>ut studiose cogitationem amplecterer</u>		k
<u>quam sollicitus repellēbam.</u>		b
<u>AEstimans igitur quod me gaudēbam inuenisse .</u>	5 25	f
<u>si scriptum esset . alicui legenti placiturum :</u>		b
<u>de hoc ipso et de quibusdam aliis .</u>		e
<u>sub persona conantis erigere *† mentem suam</u>		b
<u>ad contemplandum Deum et quaerentis intelligere quod credit .</u>		d
<u>subditum scripsi opusculum .</u>	30	b
<u>Et quoniam nec istud nec illud cuius supra meminī dignum libri</u>		
<u>nōmine</u>	6	f
<u>aut cui auctoris praeponeretur nōmen iudicābam .</u>		b
<u>nec tamen eadem sine aliquo titulo</u>		g
<u>quo aliquem in cuius manus uenirent quodāmodo</u>		g
<u>ad se legendum inuitarent dimittēda putābam :</u>	35	b
<u>unicuique suum dēdi titulum .</u>		b
<u>ut prius 'Exemplum meditandi de ratione fidēi'.</u>		a
<u>et sequens . 'Fides quaerens intellectum' diceretur .</u>		k
<u>Sed cum iam a pluribus cum his titulis utrumque transcriptum esset</u>		
<u>[? l. ēsset transcriptum] :</u>	7	b
<u>coegerunt me plures et maxime reuerendus archiepiscopus Lugdunen-</u>		
<u>sis *† HUGO nōmine</u>	40	f
<u>fungens in Gallia legatione apostolica .</u>		l
<u>qui mihi hoc ex apostolica praecipit auctoritate .</u>		f
<u>ut nomen meum illis praescriberem.</u>		b

Quod ut aptius fieret .	8	c
illud quidem 'Monologion' id est 'sólilóquium' .	45	b
istud uero 'Proslogion' id est 'állóquium' nòmináui.		a

Anselm arranged his words and ideas chiasmically.

1a	opusculum
b	quoddam
c	uelut 'Exemplum meditandi de ratione fidei'
d	cogentibus me precibus quorundam fratrum
2	edidi
3	quaerere
4a	si forte posset inueniri unum argumentum
b	Deus
5	studioseque cogitationem
6	desperans
7	cogitationem
8	impediret
9	excludere
10	tunc magis ac magis nolenti et defendenti
9'	ingerere
8'	resistendo fatigarer
7'	cogitationum
6'	desperaueram
5'	studiose cogitationem
4'a	quod me gaudebam inuenisse
b	Deum
3'	quaerentis intelligere quod credit
2'	scripsi
1'a	opusculum
b	illud cuius supra memini
c	ut prius 'Exemplum meditandi de ratione fidei'
d	coegerunt me plures

The number of sentences in the *Prooemium*, 8, represents perfection. ⁷ History began after the first Sabbath rest, on the eighth day of Creation. Abraham circumcised Isaac on the eighth day. ⁸ Jesus rose

7. See below p. 209 n. 16.

8. C. W. JONES ed. *Bedae Venerabilis Opera Pars II Opera Exegetica 1 Libri Quatuor in Principium Genesis usque ad Nativitatem Isaac et Eiectionem Ismahelis Adnotationum*, *Corpus Christianorum Series Latina CXVIII A* (Turnhout : Brepols 1967) p. 236.

on the eighth day.⁹ There are eight Beatitudes in Matthew V 3-10. In the account of precious stones in the walls of the heavenly Jerusalem in Apocalypse XXI 20:¹⁰

fundamenta muri ciuitatis omni lapide pretioso ornata ... octauum beryllus
Significat autem homines ingenio quidem sagaces, sed amplius supernae gratiae lumine refulgentes. Nam senario saepe numero perfectio designatur actionis, maxime cum in hoc numero [sc. VIII] mundi hujus sit opus consummatum.

In Greek notation the numerical value of the name of Jesus, ΙΗΣΟΥΣ, is $10 + 8 + 200 + 70 + 400 + 200 = 888$. The 8 sentences of the *Prooemium* divide by symmetry at 4 and 4.

The number of words in the *Prooemium*, 320, divides by symmetry at 160 and 160. In the central words of the central sentence of the *Prooemium* at the beginning of line 22 Anselm refers to his discovery, 'in the very conflict of thoughts thus it offered itself, what I had despaired of'.

The number of lines, 46, divides by extreme and mean ratio at 28 and 18, the number of words at 198 and 122. The golden section of lines falls at the end of line 18, at the crux of the chiasmus, and at *erigere | mentem suam* in line 28. The word *mentem* is the 122nd word from the end of the *Prooemium*. From the beginning of the *Prooemium* *mentem* 16 is the 122nd word. From *mentem* 16 to *mentis* 13 inclusive there are 22 words. From *mentem* 28 to *memini* 31 inclusive there are 22 words.

The number of words divides by $1/9$ and $8/9$ at 36 and 284. In the 36th word from the end, Anselm names his patron, Hugo archbishop of Lyons. The last 36 words divide by $1/9$ and $8/9$ at 4 and 32, at the name of the book, *Proslogion*. In the very last word Anselm refers to his naming of his book, *nominai*.

Anselm arranged important words in mathematically determined positions. Note *posset* 5, *posse* 12, *possem* 17. The number of the line in which the word occurs first added to the number of the line in which it occurs second equals the number of the line in which it occurs third. From *posset* to *possem* inclusive there are 95 words,

9. *Ibid.* p. 237.

10. J. A. GILES ed. *Venerabilis Bedae Opera Quae Supersunt Omnia* (London: Whittaker & Co. 1844) vol. XII pp. 441-2 [= *Patrologia Latina* XCIII col. 201A-B].

which divide by extreme and mean ratio at 59 and 36. After *posset* the 59th word is *posse*, from which to *possem* inclusive there are 36 words. Those 36 words divide by extreme and mean ratio at 22 and 14. Between *impossibile* 15 and *possem* there are 14 words.

Note the first word after *posset* 5 *inueniri*, and *inueniri* 15, *inuenisse* 25, *uenirent* 34. There are 37 words before *inueniri* 5 and 79 words after *uenirent* 34, together 116. From *inueniri* 5 to *uenirent* 34 inclusive there are 204 words, which divide by extreme and mean ratio at 126.1 and 77.9. From *inueniri* 5 to *inueniri* 15 inclusive there are 77 words. Between *inueniri* 15 and *uenirent* 34 there are 126 words.

Note *scriptum* 26 and *scripsi* 30, between which there are 26 words. Note *transcriptum* 39 and *praescriberem* 43, between which there are 26 words. Between *scripsi* and *transcriptum* there are 67 words, which divide by extreme and mean ratio at 41 and 26. From *scripsi* to *titulum* 33 inclusive there are 26 words, from which to *transcriptum* there are 41 words. Those 41 words divide by symmetry at 21. After *titulum* 36 the 21st word is *titulis* 39.

Note *nomine* 223, *nomen*, 228, *nomine* 287, *nomen* 300, *nominaui* 320.

The *Prooemium* discusses Anselm's discovery of a proof for the being of the God Who created the universe. Division into 46 lines reflects the fact that the account of the perfection of Sabbath rest after Creation in Genesis II 1-4 contains 46 Hebrew words, as does the account of Creation in the Vulgate text of Job XXXVIII 4-7. It reflects the fact that the account of Christ's Creation of the universe in the Prologue to Saint John's Gospel contains 46 letters in both the Greek text and the Latin of the Vulgate :

παντα	omnia
δια αυτου εγενετο	per ipsum facta sunt
και	et
χωρις αυτου εγενετο	sine ipso factum est
ουδε εν.	nihil.

It reflects the fact that the numerical value of the name of God's creature **ΑΔΑΜ** in Greek notation is $1 + 4 + 1 + 40 = 46$, and, as man's works should reflect God's work, that it took 46 years to build the Temple (John II 20).

Anselm refers to his discovery of the argument in the central words of the *Prooemium* in the 22nd line, and he repeats the interval 22 from *mentis* 13 to *mentem* 16 and from *mentem* 28 to *memini* 31 because in the account of the six days of Creation in Genesis I 1-31 God created 22 things : *materiam informem, angelos, lucem, coelos superiores, terram, aquam, aerem ; firmamentum ; maria, semina, sationes, plantaria ; solem, lunam, stellas ; pisces, reptilia aquarum, volatilia ; bestias, pecudes, reptilia terrae, hominem*. The Hebrew alphabet contains 22 letters and the Hebrew Bible 22 books. There are 22 generations from Adam to Jacob *ex cuius semine nascitur omnis gens Israel*. The account of Christ's Creation of the universe in John contains 22 syllables in the Greek text. In the Latin text the letters are arranged 22-2-22. ¹¹

III. PETRI ABAELARDI HISTORIA CALAMITATUM

For analysis of the jewel in this corona of compositions one may turn to an earlier issue of this journal, ¹² in which Abaelard's comprehensive mastery of rhyme ¹³ and rhythm and arithmetic disposition of words and ideas is readily apparent.

IV. PETRI VENERABILIS EPISTOLA AD HELOISAM

Because of the lack of a manuscript the text of Peter the Venerable's Letter to Heloise is based upon the edition of Janet Martin with a few changes. ¹⁴

11. See above n. 5.

12. D. R. HOWLETT 'Some Criteria for Editing Abaelard' *ALMA LI* (1993) pp. 195-202.

13. Particularly noteworthy is the rhyme of *profeci* with *inhesi*, proving that the Breton Abaelard wrote *e* for the Classical diphthong *ae* and pronounced *c* before *e* as *s* in the Francophone fashion.

14. J. MARTIN ed. *Peter the Venerable Selected Letters*, Toronto Medieval Latin Texts 3 (Toronto : Centre for Medieval Studies 1974) no. 115 pp. 59-66, based upon the Paris edition of 1522, folios clxiii'-clxv. I have consistently represented the Classical diphthongs *ae* and *oe* as *e*. I have otherwise altered from Martin's text *Eloysae* in the Salutation and in the letter *charitatis* 1, *Teobaldum* 1, *Christum* 30, *achademia* 31, *preciosum* 35, *econuerso* 51, *phas* 80, *prophano* 90, *nostra* 114, *Christi* 115, 134, *chariore* 136, *contempnere* 146, *urbant* 155, *charissima* 192.

VENERABILI ET IN XPISTO PLURIMUM DILECTE SORORI HELOÍSE ABBATÍSSE
FRATER PETRUS HUMILIS CLUNIACÉNSIUM ÁBBAS
SALUTEM 'QUAM PROMISIT DEUS DILIGENTIBUS SE'

Acceptis literis caritatis tue quas mihi nuper per filium meum Theobaldum misisti gauisus sum	1	
et eas mittentis gratia amicabiliter ampléxus sum .		
Volui statim rescribere quod animo insederat sed impediens importunis curarum exactionibus quibus plerumque immo pene semper cedere compéllor non pótui .	2	
Vix tamen a tumultibus tandem interpolata die quod concéperam atténtaui .	3	
Visum est ut affectui tuo erga me quem et tunc ex literis et prius ex mihi missis xéniis cognoueram saltem uerborum uicem repéndere festinárem .	4	5
Et quantum in corde meo locum tibi dilectionis in Domino seruárem osténderem .	5	
Reuera enim non nunc primum diligere incípio	6	
quam ex multo tempore me dilexisse reminíscor .		
<u>Necdum</u> plene metas adolescéntie excésseram	7	
<u>necdum</u> in iuueniles ánnos euáseram	10	
quando nomen non quidem adhuc réligiõnis tue sed honestorum tamen et laudabilium studiorum tuorum mihi fáma innótuit .		
Audiebam tunc témporis mùliérem	8	
<u>licet</u> necdum seculi néxibus expéditam		
literatorie scientie quod perrárum est et stúdio	15	
<u>licet</u> secularis sapientie summam óperam dáre		
nec mundi uoluptatibus nugis uel deliciis ab hoc utili discendarum artium proposito rétrahi pósse .		
Cunque ab his exercitiis detestanda desidia totus pene tórpeat múnus et ubi subsistere possit pés sapiéntie	9	
non dicam apud sexum femineum a quo ex tóto explósus est	20	
sed uix apud ipsos uiriles animos inueníre uáleat		
tu illo efferendo stúdio túo		
<u>et</u> mulieres ómnes euicísti		
<u>et</u> pene uiros uniuérsos superásti .		
Mox uero iuxta uérba apóstoli	10	25
'ut complacuit ei qui te segregauit ab utero matris tue uocare te per gratiam suam'		
longe in melius disciplinarum stúdia còmmutásti		
et pro logica éuangélium		
pro phýsica apóstolum		
pro Platone Xpístum	30	

<i>pro</i> académiā claustrum tota iam et uere philosophica mŭlier <i>èlegisti</i> .		
Eripuisti uictis spólia hóstibus	11	
et thesauris Aegyptiacis per huius peregrinationis desértum tránsiens pretiosum in corde tuo tabernaculum Déo <i>erexisti</i> .		35
Cantasti cum Maria demerso Pharaone cánticum laúdis	12	
et beate mortificationis tympanum ut olim illa pre mánibus <i>gérens</i> noui modulaminis melos usque ad ipsas Deitatis aures docta tym- panístriā trãnsmisisti .		
Conculcasti iam incipiendo quod per Omnipotentis gratiam bene perseuerándo cónteres	13	
uetusti anguis ac semper mulieribus ínsidiãntis cáput atque ita elides ut nunquam ulterius contra te sibiláre aúdeat .		40
Ostentui facis et facies superbum príncipem mŭndi	14	
et illum qui diuina uoce uocatur 'rex filiorum superbie' iuxta ipsius Dei ad beátum Iób uerba tibi ac tecum cohabitantibus 'ancillis Dei alligatum' ingemíscere cóges .		
Et uere singuláre miráculum	15	45
ac super omnia miranda ópera <i>èxtolléndum</i> eum quo iuxta prophetam 'cedri non fuerunt altiores in paradiso Dei' <u>et</u> cuius summitatem frondium 'abietes non adequauerunt' a frágili sèxu uínci <u>et</u> fortissimum archangelum a muliere infirmíssima sùperári .		
Gignitur tali duello maxima glória Cònditóri	16	50
infertur e conuerso summa ignomínia Dèceptóri .		
Exprobratur ei hóc certámíne	17	
non solum stultum sed et super omnia ridículum fuisse illum aspirasse ad equalitatem sublimíssime maíestátis qui nec breue luctamen ferre preualet feminee débilitátis .		55
Sustinet caput cuiuslibet uictricis illius merito talis uictorie gem- meam a rege celórum corónam	18	
ut <u>quanto in</u> transacta pugna cárne infirmior <u>tanto in</u> remuneratione sempiterna appareat glóriósior .		
Hec caríssima in Domino soror uere non adulando sed <i>éxhortando</i> díco	19	
ut magnum in quo aliquamdiu perstitisti bónum atténdens		60
ad caute illud conseruandum animósior reddáris et sanctas illas que tecum Dómino séruíunt secundum gratiam a Deo tibi collátam ut in eodem sollicitè agone contendant uerbis pariter et <i>éxémp</i> lis ac- céndas .		
<u>Es enim</u> unum de animalibus illis que Ezechiel propheta uidit	20	65
licet sis mulier que non tantum ut cárbo ardére sed ut lampas ardere debes páriter <i>èt lucére</i> .		
<u>Es quidem</u> discípula uerítátis	21	

<i>sed es etiam</i> ipso officio quantum ad tibi commissas pertinet magístra humilitátis .		
Humilitatis plane et totius celestis discipline tibi a Deo magistérium impósitum est	22	70
unde non solum tui sed et commissi gregis cúram habére et pro uniuersis maiorem uniuersis debes mercédem recíperere .		
Manet tibi certe palma pro omnibus quia ut óptime nósti <i>quotquot</i> ducatu tuo mundum mundique príncipem úcerint	23	
<i>tot</i> tibi triumphos <i>tot</i> gloriosa trophea apud eternum regem et iúdicem prèparábunt .		75
Sed nec omnino apud mortales insolitum est feminas féminis prínci- pári	24	
nec ex toto inusitatum étiam prèliári ipsum insuper uiros ad prélia còmítári .		
Nam si uérum est quod dicitur	25	
‘Fas est et ab hoste doceri’		80
et apud gentiles Amazonum regina Penthesilea cum suis Ámazónibus non uiris sed múliéribus		
Troiani belli tempore sepe pugnásse scribitur	26	
et in populo etiam Dei prophetissa Delbora Barach iudicem Israel contra ethnicos animásse légitur .		
Cur ergo non liceat feminas uirtutis contra ‘fortem armatum’ ad prelia procedentes ductrices fieri exércitus Dómini	27	85
cum et illa quod quidem indecens uidebatur manu tamen propria contra hóstes pugnauerit		
et hec nostra Delbora uiros ad bella diuína commóuerit armáuerit accénderit ?		
Victo dehinc Iabin rége	28	
occiso Sísara dúce		
deleto profáno exércitu		90
cecinit statim canticum illa illudque Dei laudibus deuóta dicáuit .		
Erit Dei gratia hóc faciénte	29	
post datam tibi tuisque de longe fortioribus hóstibus uictóriam longe tuum gloriósius cánticum		
quod sic leta cantabis ut nunquam postea letari nunquam cantáre desístas .		95
Interim eris ancillis Dei hoc est celesti exercitui quod illa suo Iudaico pópulo Délbora	30	
nec a tam lucroso certamine aliquo tempore quolibet casu nisi uin- cèndo cessábis .		
Et quia hoc nomen Delbora ut tua nouit eruditio lingua Hebraica ápem désignat	31	
eris etiam in hoc et tu Délbora id est ápis .		
Mellificabis enim tu sed nón soli tibi	32	100
quia quicquid boni per diuersos et a diuèrsis collegísti		

exemplo uerbo modisque quibus póteris domesticis sororibus seu quibuslibet aliis tótum refúndes .		
Satiabis hoc exiguo uite mortális témpore	33	
<u>et</u> te ipsam sacrarum literarum secréta dulcédine		105
<u>et</u> beatas sorores aperta prédicatione quousque iuxta uocem propheticam in illa que promíttitur <i>díe</i> 'distillent montes eternam dulcedinem et colles fluant lac' et mel .		
Hoc enim licet de hoc tempore grátie dicátur	34	
nil obstat immo et dulcius est ut de tempore glorie áccipiátur .		110
Dulce mihi esset diu tecum de huiusmodi protráhere sermónem	35	
quia <u>et</u> famosa eruditione túa deléctor <u>et</u> predicata mihi a multis religione tua longe mágis allícior .		
<u>Vtinam te Cluniacus</u> nóster habúisset	36	
<u>utinam te</u> iocundus <u>Marciniaci</u> carcer cum ceteris Xpisti ancillis libertatem inde celestem expectántibus ínclusisset .		115
<u>Pretulissem</u> opes religionis ac scientie maximis quorumlibet régum thesaúris	37	
et illarum sororum illud preclarum collegium cohabitatione tua cla- rius rutiláre gaudérem .		
<u>Retulisses</u> et ipsa ab ipsis non módicum quéstum	38	
et summam mundi nobilitatem ac superbiam pedibus substrátam mi- raréris .		
<u>Cerneres</u> omnigenos seculi luxus miranda parcitáte mutátos	39	120
<u>et</u> sordida quondam uasa Diaboli in mundissima Spiritus Sancti témpla conuérta .		
<u>Videres</u> puellas Dei Satane uel mundo uelut fúrto subtráctas	40	
super innocentie fundamentum altos uirtutum erígere paríetes <u>et</u> usque ad ipsa celi fastigia felicitis fabrice cacúmen producere .		
<u>Letaréis</u> angelica uirginitate florentes castissimis uíduis iúctas	41	125
<u>et</u> uniuersas pariter beate illius et magne resurrectionis glóriam sùsti- nénates infra arcta septa domorum etiam corporaliter beate spei uelut sepúlcro iam cónditas .		
Que <u>licet</u> omnia et fortassis maiora cum tibi datis a Deo collégis hábeas	42	
<u>licet</u> forte nihil ad sacrarum rerum studium pertinens tibi addi póssit augeretur tamen augmento gratiárum tuárum		130
non paruis ut arbitror commodis res pública nóstra .		
 Sed quamuis a dispensatrice omnium rerum prouidentia Dei hoc nobis dé te negátum sit	43	
concessum tamen est dé illo túo de illo inquam sepe ac semper cum honore nominando seruo ac uere Xpisti philosopho magistro Petro		

quem in ultimis uite sue annis eadem diuina dispositio Cluniacum trans- mísit	135
et eam in ipso et de ipso 'super omne aurum et topazion' munere carióre ditáuit .	
Cuius sancte humili ac deuote inter nos cónuersatióni	44
quod quantumue Cluniacus testimónium férat	
breuis sérmo non éxplicat .	
Nisi enim fallor non recolo uidisse me illi in humilitatis habitu et géstu símilem	45 140
in tantum ut <u>nec</u> Germánus abiéctior	
<u>nec</u> ipse Martinus bene discernenti paupérior àpparéret .	
Cunque in magno illo fratrum nostrorum grege me compellente gradum superiorem tenéret	46
ultimus omnium uestitu incultíssimo uidebátur .	
Mirabar sepe et in processionibus eo me cum reliquis pro more pre- cedente péne stupébam	47 145
tanti tanque famosi nominis hominem sic seipsum contemnere sic se abiícere pósse .	
Et quia sunt quidam religiónis professóres	48
qui ipsum quem gerunt habitum religiosum nimis esse cúpiunt sump- tuósum	
erat ille prorsus párcus in ístis	
et cuiusque generis simplici ueste contentus nil últra querébat .	150
Hoc et in cibo hoc et in potu hoc et in omni cura corporis súi seruá- bat	49
et non dico superflua sed et cuncta nisi ualde nécessária	
tam in se quam in omnibus uerbo pariter et uíta damnábat .	
Lectio erat ei continua oratio frequens siléntium iúge	50
nisi cum <i>aut</i> fratrum familiaris collatio <i>aut</i> ad ipsos in conuentu de diuinis publicus sermo eum lóqui urgébat .	155
Sacramenta celestia immortalis Agni sacrificium Deo offerendo prout póterat frèquentábat	51
immo postquam literis et labore meo apostolice gratie redditus est péne contínuábat .	
Et quid multa ?	52
Mens eius lingua eius opus eius	53
sémper diuina semper filósofica semper éruditiória	160
méditabátur docébat fatebátur .	
<u>Tali</u> nobiscum uir 'simplex et rectus timens Deum et recedens a malo'	54
<u>tali</u> inquam per aliquantum temporis conuersatione ultimos uite sue dies consecrans Deo pausánda grátia	
<u>nam</u> plus solito scabie et quibusdam corporis incommoditátibus gráuabátur	
a me Cabilónem míssus est .	165

<u>Nam</u> propter illius soli amenitatem qua cunctis pene Burgundie nostre pártibus préminet	55	
lócum ei hábilem		
prope urbem quidem sed tamen Arari interfluénte prouideram .		
Ibi iuxta quod incommóditas pèrmittébat	56	
antiqua sua renouans studia libris sémper incumbébat		170
<u>nec</u> sicut de magno Gregorio legitur momentum aliquod preteríre sinébat		
quin semper ‘aut oraret aut legeret aut scriberet aut dictaret’ .		
In his sacrorum operum exercitiis eum aduentus illius euangelici uisitatóris répperit	57	
<u>nec</u> eum ut multos dormientem sed uigilántem inuénit .		
Inuenit eum uére uigilántem	58	175
et ad eternitatis núptias <u>non ut fátuam</u>		
<u>sed ut sapientem</u> uírginem ðuocáuit .		
Attulit enim ille secum lampadem plénam <u>óleo</u>	59	
hoc est conscientiam refertam sancte uite téstimónio .		
Nam ad soluendum çommune mortalium debitum mórbo corréptus	60	180
eoque ingrauescente in breui ad extrémá perdúctus est [? l. est perdúctus].		
Túnc uero <u>quam</u> sáncte <u>quam</u> deuóte <u>quam</u> cathólice	61	
primo fidei dehinc peccatorum confessiónem fécerit		
quanto inhiantis cordis affectu uiaticum peregrinationis ac uite etérne pígnus corpus scilicet redemptoris Dómini accéperit		
quam fideliter corpus suum et animam hic et in eternum ipsi cómmen- dáuerit		185
testes sunt réligiòsi frátes		
et totus illius monasterii in quo corpus sancti martyris Marcelli iácet conuéntus .		
Hoc magister Petrus fine dies súos consummáuit	62	
et qui singulari scientie magisterio toti pene orbi terrarum notus et ubíque famòsus érat in illius discipulátu qui díxit		
‘Discite a me quia mitis sum et humilis corde’	63	190
mitis et humilis perseuerans ad ipsum ut dignum est crédere sic tran- súit .		
Hunc ergo uenerabilis et carissima in Dómino sóror	64	
cui post carnalem copulam <u>tanto ualidiore quanto meliore</u> diuine cari- tatis uínculo ádhesísti		
<u>cum quo</u> et <u>sub quo</u> diu Dómino dèseruísti		
hunc inquam loco tui et ut te alteram in gremio súo cónfouet		195
et in aduéntu Dómini		
in uóce archángeli		
et in tuba Dei descendéntis de célo		
tibi per ipsius gratiam restituéndum reséruat .		

<u>Esto ergo</u> in Domino mémor ipsúus	65	200
<u>esto etiam</u> si plácet et méi		
et sanctis sororibus tecum Domino <i>fámulántibus</i>		
fratres congregatiónis nostre [? l. nostre cóngregatiónis]		
ac sorores que ubique terrarum pro posse suo eidem cui et tu Dómino		
<i>fámulántur</i>		
sollícite comménda .		205

The syntax of the Salutation suggests arrangement in three lines, of which the first two end with the related words *abbatisse* and *abbas*, and the first and third end with the same letters and sounds, *-sse*. The third word from the beginning is the first of *in Xpisto*, and the third word from the end is *Deus*. There are 6 words from *abbatisse* to *abbas* inclusive. There are 12 words between *dilecte* and *diligentibus*. The Salutation contains 20 words, 56 syllables, and 131 letters, which divide by symmetry at 10 words, at | *Petrus*, 28 syllables, at | *Petrus*, and 66 letters, at *Pet | rus*. The Salutation divides by sesquialter ratio at 12 and 8 words, at *Heloise* |, 34 and 22 syllables, at *Heloise* |. The initials of the first, central, and last sentences spell *AVE*. The 131 letters of the Salutation confirm the number of 131 lines from the beginning of the six-lined *Captatio benevolentiae* to the end of the passage about Heloise, as the 199 letters of the six-lined Valediction confirm the number of 199 lines from the beginning of the *Captatio benevolentiae* to the end of the passage about Abaelard.¹⁵

The number of sentences from the beginning of the *Captatio benevolentiae* to the end of the passage about Abaelard is 64, the square of 8, representing perfection.¹⁶

Peter arranged his words and ideas carefully. In the *Captatio benevolentiae* compare *litteris caritatis tue quas mihi ... misisti* near the beginning with *affectui tuo erga me ... ex litteris ... ex mihi missis* near the end.

In writing about Heloise Peter composed consistently in short chiasmic passages.

15. For comparable devices see *The Celtic Latin Tradition of Biblical Style* pp. 108-13, 243-9, 260-2, 337-8, 355-63, 375-8, 394, and 'Numerical Play in Wulfstan's Verse and Prose' *Mittellateinisches Jahrbuch XXXI* (1996) pp. 61-7.

16. See above p. 199 n. 7.

12	1	studiorum
13	2	mulierem
15	3	studio
16	4	sapientie
17	5a	mundi
17	b	posse
18	6	cunquē ab his exercitiis detestanda desidia totus pene torpeat
18	5'a	mundus
19	b	possit
19	4'	sapientie
22	3'	studio
23	2'	mulieres
27	1'	studia
32	1	mulier
34	2	transiens
37	3	tympanum
38	4	noui modulaminis melos
38	3'	tympanistria
38	2'	transmisisti
40	1'	mulieribus

He also composed more extensive chiasmic and parallel patterns.

7	1a	primum	96	1'a	interim
8	b	tempore	97	b	tempore
13	c	temporis	104	c	tempore
15	d	litteratorie	105	d	litterarum
15	e	scientie	116	e	scientie
34	f	thesauris	116	f	thesauris
36	2a	cantasti	91	2'a	cecinit
36	b	canticum	91	b	canticum
36	c	laudis	91	c	laudibus
37	3	manibus	94	b'	canticum
40	4	mulieribus	95	a'	cantabis ... cantare
47	5	prophetam	86	3'	manu
47	6	Dei	85	4'	feminas
48	7	uinci	84	5'	prophetissa
49	8	muliere	84	6'	Dei
49	9	superari	83	7'	pugnasse
55	10	feminee	82	8'	mulieribus
56	11	rege	76	9'	principari
58	12	sempiterna	76	10'	feminas feminis
			75	11'	regem
			75	12'	eternum

58	13	gloriosior	75	13'	gloriosa
60	14a	magnum	72	14'a	maiolem
60	b	bonum	72	b	mercedem
61	c	reddaris	72	c	recipere
66	15a	non tantum	71	15'a	non solum
67	b	sed ... et	71	b	sed et
68	16a	discipula	70	16'a	discipline
69	b	tibi	70	b	tibi
69	c	magistra	70	c	magisterium
69	17	humilitatis	70	17'	humilitatis

Woven into the same passage is another extensive chiasmus with parallelism.

7-8	1a	diligere ... dilexisse
11	b	religionis tue
12-22	c	studiorum ... studio ... studio
22	d	tuo
25	2a	iuxta uerba apostoli
26	b	'ut complacuit ei qui te segregauit ab utero matris uocare te per gratiam suam'
27	3a	longe in melius
33	b	uictis
33	4	hostibus
42	5	principem
42	6	mundi
47	7	iuxta prophetam [Ezechiel]
59	8	Hec carissima in Domino soror uere no adu- lando sed exhortando dico
65	7'	Ezechiel propheta
74	6'	mundique
74	5'	principem
86-93	4'	hostes ... hostibus
94	3a'	longe ... gloriosius
97	b	uincendo
107	2a'	iuxta uocem propheticam
108	b	'distillent montes eternam dulcedinem et colles fluant lac'
112	1'a	delector
113-6	b	religione tua ... religionis
129	c	studium
129	d	tibi

The crux of the first chiasmus occurs at the end of line 69, the 63rd and central line of the 125-lined passage about Heloise. The crux of the second chiasmus occurs after the 11th syllable of the 11-word line 59, *Hec carissima in Domino soror*, of which the last is the 387th word of the 1013-word passage about Heloise, 1013 dividing by extreme and mean ratio at 626 and 387.

Recognition of the outlines of the chiasmic structures allows one to see what Peter has done with his Biblical quotations and allusions. In line 25 he writes *iuxta uerba apostoli*, as in line 107 he writes *iuxta uocem propheticam*. The latter introduces a quotation from the Book of the Prophet Joel III 18. The former introduces a quotation from the Epistle of the Apostle Paul to the Galatians I 15, but as that alludes to the Book of the Prophet Isaiah XLIX 1 the two passages are more nearly parallel than might appear at first glance. From line 36 onward Peter alludes to the Song of Miriam in Exodus XV 20-1, as from line 91 onward he alludes to the Song of Deborah in Judges V. Immediately after the Song of Miriam, from line 39, Peter alludes to the antagonism of Eve and the Serpent without quotation of Genesis III 15. Immediately before the Song of Deborah, in line 85, he quotes Luke XI 21, alluding in the preceding words to the *femina uirtutis* whose correct response issued in defeat of the Serpent, but without quoting Luke I 26-56. The quotations from Job XL 24 and XLI 25 in lines 43 and 44 have no immediately apparent parallel with the quotation from Ovid *Metamorphoses* IV 428 in line 80. The contexts from which Peter extracted them make the connection, but only when the reader recollects that in the former God and in the latter Juno assert divine authority. In line 47 Peter writes *iuxta prophetam* without naming the source, trusting to Heloise's knowledge and ours that he is quoting the Book of the Prophet Ezekiel XXXI 8. In line 65, on the other hand, he names *Ezechiel propheta*, then alludes to but does not quote the prophet's vision related from I 13. These parallels are not immediately obvious, neither repeating the same diction nor using the same devices, but subtly implying connections that become complete only with realization by the reader.

Here follows a chiasmic pattern from the passage about Abaelard.

132	1	Dei
135	2	diuina
136	3	cariore
137	4	humili

140	5	humilitatis
143	6	fratrum
147	7	religionis
147	8	professores
151	9	corporis sui
153	10	uita
159	11	opus
160	12	semper ... semper ... semper
164	13	incommoditatibus
165	14	Cabilonem
166	15	cunctis pene Burgundie nostre partibus preminet
168	14'	urbem
169	13'	incommoditas
170-2	12'	semper ... semper
173	11'	operum
179	10'	uite
185	9'	corpus suum
186	8'	testes
186	7'	religiosi
186	6'	fratres
190	5'	humilis
191	4'	humilis
192	3'	carissima
193	2'	diuine
198	1'	Dei

Woven into the same passage and the Valediction is a parallel pattern.

134	1	philosopho magistro Petro
135	2	ultimis uite sue annis
135	3	transmisit
143	4	magno
143	5	grege
154	6	lectio erat ei continua oratio frequens
160	1'	philosophica
163	2'	ultimos uite sue dies
165	3'	missus est
171	4'	magno
171	5'	Gregorio
172	6'	semper aut oraret aut legeret
188	1"	magister Petrus
188	2"	dies suos consummauit
191	3"	transiuit
193	4"	tanto ualidiore quanto meliore

203 5" congregationis
 204 6" Domino famulantur

In the chiasmic passage the first part extends from line 132 to line 165 and the second part from line 166 to line 199, 34 lines each. In the parallel passage the first part extends from line 132 to line 159, the second from line 160 to line 187, the third from line 188 to line 205. As the 74 lines divide by extreme and mean ratio at 46 and 28, the minor part is the first, of 28 lines, and the major part is the second and the third, of 46 lines, which divide in turn by extreme and mean ratio at 28 and 18, the major part of this being the second, of 28 lines, and the minor part the third, of 18 lines.

Now let us consider ways in which Peter linked the passage about Heloise with that about Abaelard. First in a comprehensive chiasmus.

6	1	in Domino
26	2	te per gratiam suam
49	3	archangelum
57-8	4	ut quanto in transacta pugna carne infirmior tanto in remuneratione sempiterna appareat dico
59	5	hec carissima in Domino soror
62	6	sanctas
67	7	lampas
71	8	gregis
92	9	gratia
98	10	eruditio
105	11	literarum
111	12	sermonem
114	13	Cluniacus
115	14	Xpisti
131	15	res
132	15'	rerum
134	14'	Xpisti
135	13'	Cluniacum
139	12'	sermo
157	11'	litteris
160	10'	eruditiora
163	9'	gratia
171	8'	Gregorio
178	7'	lampadem
179	6'	sancte
192	5'	hunc ... carissima in Domino soror

193	4'	cui post carnalem copulam tanto ualidiore quanto meliore diuine caritatis uinculo adhesisti
197	3'	archangeli
199	2'	tibi per ipsius gratiam
200	1'	in Domino
204		Domino

In part 1 the first of *in Domino* is the fourth word from the end of the beginning, and in part 1' *Domino* is the fourth word from the beginning of the end, as *Domino* is the fourth word from the end of the letter. *Quanto in ... tanto in* in part 3 are reversed as *tanto ... quanto* in part 3'. In this as in the preceding passages much of the diction is unusual, some of it recurring only in these parallels.

There is also a parallelism that connects the passage about Heloise with that about Abaelard.

10	1	annos
13	2	audiebam tunc temporis mulierem
32	3	philosophica
68	4ai	discipula
69	ii	magistra
69	b	humilitatis
70	b'	humilitatis
70	ai	discipline
70	ii	magisterium
135	1'	annis
140	2'	nisi enim fallor non recolo uidisse me illi ... similem
160	3'	philosophica
189	4'aii	magisterio
189	i	discipulatu
190	b	humilis

When one recollects the aggressive martial imagery of Abaelard's diction at the beginning of the *Historia Calamitatum*¹⁷ and the career of Heloise as pupil and lover and mother and abbess the role reversal in this letter strikes one forcefully, for while Peter compares Heloise with the aggressive martial women Miriam and Deborah and Penthesilea, he not only compares the pugnaciously arrogant

17. militari cingulo, litteris antequam armis instrui disponeret, militaris glorie pompam, Martis curie, his armis alia commutauit et tropheis bellorum conflictus pretuli disputationum, disputando, castra posui, obsessurus.

Abaelard with *Germanus abiectus* and *Martinus pauper* and the scholarly *Gregorius magnus*, but even describes him as a wise virgin.

Peter plays scrupulously with words designating the passage of time. He writes in line 9 *necdum plene metas adolescentie excesseram* and in line 10 *necdum in iuueniles annos euaseram*. Beginning to count from *reuera* in line 7 the 18th word is *adolescentie*, still within the *metas adolescentie*, years 15-21, and the 22nd word is *iuueniles*, the first of the *iuueniles annos*, years 22-42. He writes in line 135 of Abaelard *quem in ultimis uite sue annis*, the last word being the 1142nd word of the letter, as A.D. 1142 was the year of Abaelard's death. He writes in line 163 *ultimos uite sue dies*, of which *sue*, at the golden section of the 14-word line, is the central 304th of 607 words of the passage about Abaelard, implying perhaps that one of the days between the 302nd and the 305th of the year, from 29 October to 1 November, was the day of Abaelard's death. He writes *Hoc magister Petrus fine dies suos consummauit* in line 188,¹⁸ the 12th line from the end of the passage about Abaelard and the 144th word from the end of the Valediction.¹⁹ As line 188 contains the 62nd sentence of the letter, and as Peter writes in line 191 *sic transiuit*, of which the first word is the 62nd from the end of the passage about Abaelard, Peter may have reckoned 62 to be Abaelard's age at death.²⁰

No one who has read this far will suppose that the preceding analysis is complete. But it is complete enough to suggest that this letter has been wrought with deeper thought and higher art than its modern admirers have yet perceived. In its structure there is nothing new or unique; all the architectonic features can be paralleled in Cambro-Latin compositions of the fifth and sixth centuries, in Hiberno-Latin compositions of the sixth and seventh centuries, and

18. For play with 188 lines by an earlier writer see 'Aldhelm and Irish Learning' pp. 42, 54, *British Books in Biblical Style* pp. 111, 121.

19. For play on the number 12 and its square 144 see *The Celtic Latin Tradition of Biblical Style* pp. 262-4, 'Three Works by Virgilius Maro Grammaticus' in 'Seven Studies' pp. 50-7, and *Cambro-Latin Compositions* pp. 130-4.

20. If Abaelard was born in November or December 1079 and died not later than 1 November 1142 the calculation is within one year of correctness, according to the usual modern reckoning.

in Anglo-Latin compositions of the seventh and eighth centuries. But Peter is a notable exponent of several particulars. One is the technical imbalance of his quotations and allusions, identifying one as from the apostle, but leaving the reader to make the connection between the apostle's allusion to one prophet and Peter's quotation from another. Again, quoting but not naming Ezekiel, then naming him but alluding to rather than quoting from his text. In this as in much else the author invites the reader to participate by drawing inferences, without which the authorial implications remain incomplete. Another particular is the manner in which the chiasmic and parallel structures entwine, neither drawing attention to themselves, nor getting in the ways of the others, nor appearing arch or overwrought, nor impeding the development of the thought. The letter is a spectacular example of verbal composition that would be in the hands of a painter intensely polychromatic and in the hands of a musician densely polyphonic.

To have attracted the love of so egotistical a genius as Abaelard is remarkable. To have provoked the quality of thought and writing in the *Historia Calamitatum* more so. To have demanded and maintained the correspondence that issued from Heloise's reading of the *Historia Calamitatum* even more so. To have elicited this letter confirms everything else, for in it Peter, revealing himself as truly venerable, presents to us in praise that is neither faint nor feint one of the greatest women of the millennium.

V. JOHANNIS SARESBERIENSIS EPISTOLA AD FRATREM RICARDUM

The text of the letter from John of Salisbury to his brother Richard is that of London, British Library, MS Cotton Claudius B. II, folios 210va-211va.²¹ Capital letters and punctuation marks in boldface represent features of the manuscript .

21. This differs only in a few details of spelling and word order from the text of W. J. MILLOR & C. N. L. BROOKE ed. & transl. *The Letters of John of Salisbury*, Oxford Medieval Texts (Oxford : Clarendon Press 1979), no. 172 vol. II pp. 128-32.

JOHANNES SARESBERIENSIS RICARDO FRATRI SUO. CXXIII.

IN te omnium moriturorum dulcissime plane uidebor iniurius .	1
si cuiquam a peregrinatione mea scripsero .	
subticens tibi .	
quem super statu meo cum Deo amabili matre nostra	
non ambigo pre ceteris mortalibus esse sollicitum .	5
Licet enim interdum desit materia uel occasio scribendorum .	2
hoc ipsum tibi scribendum arbitror .	
scribendi occasionem uel materiam defuisse .	
Quod autem domino episcopo scripsi . tibi pariter innotescet .	3
sicut ea que tibi scripta sunt sinceritati eius poteris presentare .	10
Volo enim ut ei in omnibus adquiescas que ad te pertinent .	4
et consilium eius preferas meo .	
<u>tum quia</u> nobis sapientior est .	
<u>tum quia</u> eum ulteriorem Dei gratiam habere confido .	
et nos quos semper dilexit caritate sincera .	15
<u>sicut</u> auctoritate <u>sic et</u> meritis antecedit .	
Quod autem ei scribendum fuerat	5
nisi deficientis prothocolli breuitas obstitisset .	
ei meo nomine <u>uaderi</u> desidero .	
et utinam <u>persuadeat</u> Spiritus Sanctus	20
qui in necessitatis articulo sperantes in se solatio consilii destitutos	
esse non sinit .	
Hoc autem est ut in hoc conflictu potestatis et iuris ea moderacione	
incadat .	6
preuia lege .	
dulce gratia .	
iuuante ratione .	25
ut <u>nec</u> temeritatis reus uideri debeat aduersus potestatem quam Deus	
ordinauit .	
<u>nec</u> metu potestatis aut amore rerum euanescentium iniquitati consentiat	
<u>in</u> depressionem ecclesie .	
et <u>in</u> perniciem	
<u>tam</u> presentium	30
<u>quam</u> futurorum	
<u>non modo</u> desertor officii . professionis preuaricator .	
<u>sed etiam</u> impugnator iustitie habeatur .	
Sed dices fortasse quod mihi sicut cuique facilius est dictu facienda	
prescribere :	7
quam factu que prescripta fuerint adimplere .	35
Nam et liber uorandus dulcescit in ore prophete :	8

sed ad interiora transmíssus amaréscit .	
Orator quoque in árte dicèndi ^a dócet	9
quia in artem precepta tradere et de arte dícere ^b facíllimum <i>est</i> :	
sed ex arte difficíllimum .	40
id est que preceperis obseruáre mandáta .	
Nusquam uero difficílius quam in árte uiuéndi .	10
Illa síquidem ars ártium est	11
et sicut utilitate sic et difficultate incomparabiliter alias transcéndit uniuérſas .	
Illud quoque comici nóstri adícies .	12 45
quia ‘omnes cum ualemus : recta consilia egrotis damus . tu autem si hic sis . aliter sentias ’ .	
Ad quod égo replicábo	13
quoniam licet hanc ‘auream mediocritatem’ quam prescribo seruare non nóuerim aut non quéam .	50
liricum tamen licénter imitábor .	
‘Fungens uice cotis . acutum	14
reddere que ferrum ualet : exors ipsa secandi’ .	
Non equidem hanc sollicitúdinem géro .	15
quod de tanto et de tam sincero patre Deus scit sinistram ali- quam suspiciónem concéperim .	55
sed quia in periculis amici caritas non sollicitári nón potest .	
Noui enim prepotentium persecutorum instantiam debilitátem ec- clésiæ .	16
licet dominus papa iam plurimum conualescat et confortétur in Dómino .	
Noui etiam pusillanimitatem hinc quorúmdam episcopórum .	17
inde aliórum inuúdiam .	60
ut nichil sit quod mágis uérear . quam ne in fálsis frátribus ^c .	
<u>et</u> his qui uidebantur áliquid ésse .	
<u>et</u> auctoritate grádus et litterárum .	
<u>et</u> habitus simulatióne préminent .	65
periclitetur innocéntia eíus .	
Nam et duces qui in Israel officio principabántur et mérito .	18
Moyses uidélicet et Áaron	
ad aquas contradictionis impetu multítudinis lápsi sunt .	
ut terre promissionis demereréntur intróitum .	70
Apud nos uero fama uulgauit Anglorum episcopos iam sépius còn- uenísse .	19
ut deliberent et decernant quid fácto ópus sit .	
Sed quid queso uére decernent	20
nisi se turbári et timére .	
et utrúmque supra módum ?	75
Quid decernent .	21

nisi quod cedere maluérunt impudénter . quam iniuriam uiríliter pròpulsáre ?		
Quíd decernent uére .	22	
nisi quod iníquitas dõminétur .		80
et ipsi peccantibus non annúntient uítam súam . nec uiam Dèi osténdunt ?		
Nec hoc dixerim quód eum uélim	23	
aut suadeam dirigere brachia cóntra torréntem . aut ut se multitudini imprudénter oppónat .		85
et ecclesiam suam exponat perículis èt erúmpnis . sed ut imitetur quod bonos fecisse légimus . ut Cúsaí Arachítem		
qui consilium et malitiam Achitofel moderatione adhibita stúduit dissipáre .		
et in eo etiam fidelius cum Absalóne uersátus est .		90
quod ei materiam peccánda sústulit . et parricidii preclúsit occásiónem .		
Nunquid enim fidéles opináris .	24	
qui peccandi uias domino régi expédiunt . et in eo stúdiósi sunt .		95
ut prosperetur in his que aduersus Dei iustítiam prèsumúntur ? Vter tibi uidétur fidélior .	25	
an qui ad nutum erronei mínistrat cúlpas . an qui perniciosas ábigit uòluptátes ?		
Sentiat unusquisque quód uolúerit .	26	100
ego nunquam domino uel amico reputábo fidélem qui sic illius obtémperat uòluptáti . ut salutis et uite dispéndium áfferat . nisi forte fidelem Sauli putes fuisse Ídumeum Dóech .		
qui sacerdotes Domini gladio quo seipsum erat transfossúrus occídít . et Achitofel fuit necessárius Ábsalon . quo suadente palam in uxores patris commísit incéstum . et parricidium commíttere dispónébat .		105
Dicitur et utinam falsus sit dominum Lúndoniénsem	27	
et illum meum amicum episcopum Cicestrénsem . ministros iniquitatis armare aduersus eccléssiam ^d . et Cantuariensis archiepiscopi sitíre sánguinem . et id agere ne ei unquam réditus páteat .		110
Nunquid timent ne féritas mansuéscat .	28	
aut ut a Ciceróne usurpátum est 'ne refrigeat hasta Cesaris' . aut gládius hèbetétur ?		115
Sed ego quod non plurimi fábulam púto .	29	
Neque enim tanti sacerdotes sapientes sunt ut fáciant mála .	30	
presertim cum ipsi nouerint quoniam si iniquitas préualúerit .		120

'pena reuersura est in caput ista suum' .	
Neque enim eos latere potest quomodo de ramno in regem subli-	
mata ignis egressus est	31
qui deuorat cedros Libani .	123
Vale et officiose saluta quos noueris salutandos .	32
sed affectu precipuo matrem .	125
Impetra nobis orationum suffragia .	33
ne nos a uia sua patiatur Dominus aberrare .	
sed pro beneplacito suo	
siue per prospera siue per aduersa .	
triumphatis affectionibus carnis et uitii omnibus eo ducat et pertrahat .	130
unde exultantes in eo et in nobis despiciamus inferiora	
et compatiamur miseris .	
qui modo circa sarcinulas ecclesie et nostras diripiendas inutfliter	
occupantur .	133

MS a discendi. b discere. c fratrib; . d ecclesias.

John composed a Salutation of one sentence, 5 lines 1-5, and 32 words, and a Valediction of two sentences, 10 lines 124-33, and 65 words. By all three criteria, numbers of sentences, numbers of lines, and numbers of words, the Valediction relates to the Salutation by duple ratio 2:1. The letter proper contains 30 sentences, 118 lines 6-123, and 730 words. The entire composition of 133 lines divides by 1/9 and 8/9 at 15 and 118, exactly the division between the Salutation and Valediction and the letter proper.

John arranged his words and ideas in short discrete passages, with chiasmus in lines 1-5, 6-8, 35-49, mixed chiasmus and parallelism in lines 9-10, and parallelism in lines 13-4, 16, 26-33. Here follows an outline of the Salutation.

1	1	omnium moriturorum
2	2	mea
3	3	tibi
4	3'	quem
4	2'	meo
5	1'	ceteris mortalibus

The 32 words of the Salutation divide by symmetry at 16 and 16, from *In te* to *tibi* inclusive and from *quem* to *sollicitum* inclusive, all referring to John's brother Richard. The 32 words divide by extreme

and mean ratio at 20 and 12, 20 dividing by the same ratio at 12 and 8. There are 12 words before *mea* 2 and 12 words after *meo* 4, the 20th word. The eighth word *iniurius* refers to John. There are 8 words from *mea* 2 to *meo* 4 inclusive, referring to John, of which the central fourth word is *tibi*, referring to Richard. There are 8 words between *tibi* and *nostra*, of which the central fourth word is *meo*, referring to John.

The 32 words of Salutation are balanced by the 65 words of Valediction, which divide by extreme and mean ratio at 40 and 25. Between *affectedu* 125 and *affectionibus* 129 there are 25 words.

Here follow further examples of discrete passages the structures of which are so obvious as to need no comment.

6	1	desit
6	2	materia
6	3	uel
6	4	occasio
6	5	scribendorum
7	6	hoc ipsum tibi scribendum arbitror
8	5'	scribendi
8	4'	occasionem
8	3'	uel
8	2'	materiam
8	1'	defuisse
9	1	quod autem
9	2a	domino episcopo
9	b	scripsi
9	c	tibi
9	3	innotescet
10	1'	sicut ea que
10	2'c	tibi
10	b	scripta sunt
10	a	sinceritati eius
10	3'	poteris presentare
35	1	que prescripta fuerint adimplere
37	2	ad interiora transmissus
38	3	in arte dicendi
39	4	precepta tradere
39	5	et de arte dicere facillimum est
40-1	5'	sed ex arte difficillimum id est
41	4'	preceperis obseruare mandata

42	3'	in arte uiuendi
44	2'	alias transcendit uniuersas
49	1'	quam prescribo seruare non nouerim

John bound the entire letter in a great chiasmus.

4	1	Deo
4	2	matre
13	3	sapientior
38	4	Orator
57	5a	ecclesie
58	b	dominus papa
59	6	episcoporum
62	7	falsis
68	8	Moyses et Aaron
69	9a	ad aquas contradictionis impetu
69	b	multitudinis
69	c	lapsi sunt
70	d	ut terre repromissionis demerentur introitum
83	9'a	contra torrentem
85	b	multitudini
85	c	opponat
86	d	et ecclesiam suam exponat periculis et erumnis
88-9	8'ai	Cusai et Achitofel
90	ii	Absalone
91	iii	quod ei materiam peccandi sustulit
92	iv	et parricidii preclusit occasionem
93	bi	nunquid enim fideles opinaris qui
94	ii	domino
96	c	ut prosperetur in his que aduersus Dei iustitiam presumuntur
97	di	uter tibi uidetur
97	ii	fidelior
98	e	an qui ad nutum erronei ministrat culpas
99	e'	an qui perniciosas abigit uoluptates
100	d'i	sentiat unusquisque quod uoluerit
101	ii	fidelem
103	c'	ut salutis et uite dispendium afferat
104	b'i	nisi forte fidelem ... putes ... qui
105	ii	Domini
106	ai	Achitofel
106	ii	Absalon
107	iii	quo suadente palam in uxores patris commisit incestum
108	iv	et parricidium committere disponebat

109	7'	falsus
110	6'	episcopum
111	5'a	ecclesiam
112	b	Cantuariensis archiepiscopi
115	4'	Cicerone
119	3'	sapientes
125	2'	matrem
127	1'	Dominus

Note the clustered interwoven features of lines 38-44. As there are seven liberal arts John uses the word *ars* seven times: *arte* 38, *artem* 39, *arte* 39, *arte* 40, *arte* 42, *ars artium* 43. From the first to the second inclusive there are 6 words. From the second to the third inclusive there are 6 words. The fourth is the sixth word after the third. Between the fourth and the fifth there are 12 (6 x 2) words. From the fifth to the sixth and seventh inclusive there are 6 words. In the same passage John writes *facillimum* 39, *difficillimum* 40, *difficilius* 42, *difficultate* 44. The 30 words from *facillimum* to *difficultate* inclusive divide by symmetry at *difficilius*, the 15th word. Those 15 words divide by extreme and mean ratio at 9 and 6, at *difficillimum*, the sixth word.

Note particularly lines 49-50 *quoniam licet hanc 'auream mediocritatem' quam prescribo seruare non nouerim aut non queam*. As the 13 words of these clauses divide by extreme and mean ratio at 8 and 5, the golden mean of the lines falls at *auream mediocritatem*. As the 730 words divide by extreme and mean ratio at 451 and 279, the golden mean of the letter proper falls at *auream | mediocritatem*, a mean feat John says *quam prescribo seruare non nouerim aut non queam*.

The clause in line 109, *et utinam falsus sit dominum Lundoniensem*, a man John believes *Cantuariensis archiepiscopi sitire sanguinem*, begins with the 666th word of the entire composition.²² The parallel of *falsus* here with *in falsis fratribus* 62 and the implicit identification of the bishop of London with Achitofel and association with the number of the beast combine in insolent but subtle invective that spares John the need to name his antagonist Gilbert Foliot.

22. For play on the number 666 by other writers see 'Aldhelm and Irish Learning' p. 52, *British Books in Biblical Style* p. 119, and 'Fixed Form in Philobiblon' in 'Sixes and Sevens in Anglo-Latin Prologues', *Mittelateinisches Jahrbuch* (forthcoming).

SOME CONCLUSIONS

These analyses leave no shred of doubt that all five authors composed in numbered sentences, numbered *cola et commata*, numbered words, numbered syllables, numbered letters. The manner of quoting from and alluding to earlier texts, authors' implications relying upon readers' inferences to realize and complete the connections, is consistent with the manner of presenting finished texts, in no case arranged *per cola et commata*, yet requiring recognition of the underlying structures. In acknowledging this we may begin to appreciate what we have lost, a cultural milieu in which not only did writers write brilliantly in this tradition, but readers read, perhaps hearers heard, with understanding both deeper and fuller than ours, though without any of the visual analytical aids presented here.²³ The intellectual acuity and suppleness that issued in these compositions must be apparent to anyone who follows the analyses. Unless comparable intellectual acuity and suppleness had been assumed in the readers and hearers to whom these compositions were directed there would have been no point in writing like this. The five authors whose works we have considered clearly believed that there was point in writing like this. Recovering their point of view would do us no harm.

D. R. HOWLETT
Dictionary of Medieval Latin from British Sources
Bodleian Library
Oxford

23. Just as no extant manuscript presents a text of these letters arranged *per cola et commata*, no extant manuscript presents any Old English poem arranged in verse lines, nor do ancient copies of Hebrew and Greek and Latin texts exhibit words separated by blank spaces. But it would be foolish for a modern reader who needs help in reading such texts to infer that ancient and mediaeval readers were unaware of the divisions between words and verse lines and *cola et commata*. Even more foolish to suppose those readers unable to recognize the rhythms and the ratios of harmonic and cosmic theory inculcated in the basic texts of their curriculum.